

November 21, 2019

Mayor and Council
City of Victoria
1 Centennial Square
Victoria BC V8W 1P6

RE: APPLICATION FOR DEVELOPMENT PERMIT - Art Gallery of Greater Victoria – 1040 Moss St.

Dear Mayor and Council,

Since submitting a new development permit application for the Art Gallery of Greater Victoria's (AGGV) renewal project on December 5, 2018, we have been through an iterative design review process with panels and staff. A new development permit was determined to be required by the neighbourhood planner due to changes in the material of the third level, which was modified in a value engineering process undertaken in 2017-2018 to ensure the financial viability of this cultural project. To reiterate the goals of the project, the renovation to the AGGV contributes to the preservation and improvement upon existing cultural spaces in the city, consistent with the Official Community Plan to "encourage and assist the expansion of exhibition space at ... the Art Gallery of Greater Victoria." (16.18.1, OCP) It also promotes the goals of Create Victoria to "serve a range of ongoing creative space needs for artistic and creative production, display, enjoyment, and participation" (p27, Objective 1.3, Create Victoria) and to develop cultural spaces for community engagement and wellness. We are grateful to the City of Victoria in its role as partner, custodian, and host of arts and culture in the city, valuing "the importance of the arts to foster social inclusion and reflect a whole, healthy community." (p20, Values and Guiding Principles, Create Victoria)

Description of Proposal:

Located in the Rockland neighbourhood, the proposed project is a renovation and an area increase of the existing facility to improve upon the public experience of the gallery and to provide much-needed operational upgrades. Rezoning of the property was completed in 2015, with the building design delivered by Lang Wilson Practice in Architecture Culture and Moore Wilson Architects at that stage. Key components of the project include:

- Upgrading the building to a Class A museum facility
- Adding two levels to the building to expand exhibition, collections, and public gathering space
- Creating a fully-glazed two-storey lobby area that invites the public inside, with improved reception and gift shop, along with a new café, lounge, multipurpose event space, and open Level 2 gallery
- Improving outdoor use with a new public plaza at Moss St., an accessible ground level terrace at the Asian Garden, and a sculpture terrace at the upper level of the gallery
- Enhancing the Spencer mansion by reducing the physical connection to the gallery, demolishing the garage addition on the north side, and restoring its heritage architectural character on the east building face
- Restoring the natural landscape of the site and providing accessible safe navigation for pedestrians, cyclists, and drivers
- Expressing and celebrating the AGGV's vision and values through a contemporary architectural approach to massing and exterior material use.

A CORPORATE PARTNERSHIP

Principals

DARRYL CONDON
Architect AIBC, AAA, SAA, OAA,
FRAIC, LEED AP

KAREN MARLER
Architect AIBC, AAA, SAA, OAA,
FRAIC, LEED AP

STUART ROTHNIE
Architect AIBC, SAA, OAA,
MRAIC, LEED AP

CARL-JAN RUPP
Architect AIBC, SAA, OAA,
MRAIC, Dip-Ing, LEED AP

PAUL FAST
Architect AIBC, MRAIC

MICHAEL HENDERSON
Architect AIBC, MRAIC

MELISSA HIGGS
Architect AIBC, MRAIC

HCMA Architecture + Design

205-26 Bastion Square
Victoria BC V8W 1H9 Canada

250.382.6650

hcma.ca

Benefits & Amenities

Upgrading the art gallery is an investment into the history and future of arts and culture in the city. As identified in Create Victoria, there is a continual need for increase and improvement to cultural spaces in the city. In consideration of this, the project provides the following benefits:

- Improve the physical environment for preservation of significant collections of Asian art, regional art, Indigenous art, contemporary art, and other works representative of our cultural histories
- Accommodate traveling exhibitions and the borrowing of works from other institutions, reinforcing the city's reputation as a premier cultural destination and offering residents a full breadth of artistic perspectives beyond our local context
- Expand the gallery's ability to host existing and new cultural events such as the TD Art Gallery Paint-In, as well as its ability to provide space rental for events programmed by others
- Adaptive reuse of the existing facility to reduce the environmental impacts of new construction
- Restore the native ecosystem of the area by converting lawn into Garry Oak meadow

New community amenities proposed in this project include:

- Activating the improved lobby as a neighbourhood living room that acts as a hub for daily community activity, including a café, lounge, gift shop, and multipurpose spaces
- Improving outdoor areas for community use through the provision of a public plaza and garden terrace, providing new seating, improvement to streetscape, and public art

Neighbourhood Context

Careful consideration was given to the design to strike a balance between developing a facility suited to its use as a public cultural institution and respecting the needs of its adjacent residential neighbours.

- The AGGV hosts ongoing conversations with the Rockland Neighbourhood Association, the public, and immediate neighbours throughout the project development. The design has been refined to address their concerns.
- The proposed design is consistent with requirements of the AGGV Zone (Comprehensive Development Institutional Zone), including its usage, building height, setbacks, floor space ratio, and site coverage
- The building layout concentrates public usage towards Moss St. and reduces activity in rear yards
- The building's public front is animated by transparency of the lobby, abstract reflection and refraction of surrounding nature in the form of a pixelated upper volume, while the back-of-house consists of simple and understated volumes and materials
- The native ecosystem of Garry Oak meadows is restored on site
- Existing Garry Oak and Sequoia trees are preserved on site, and where retention is not possible, replacement native trees are provided at a 2:1 ratio to meet the Tree Preservation Bylaw.
- The prominence of the Spencer mansion is maintained: the original heritage character of the mansion is restored with the re-introduction of considered building separation and celebrated with new observation points through the lobby and at the upper levels of the gallery
- The project meets the vehicle and bicycle parking requirements as set out in zoning guidelines. The design accommodates access to the facility via walking, cycling, cars, and bus service.

- The gallery is well-served by existing City of Victoria infrastructure. There will be improvements to existing site services, including upgrades to water service, storm drainage, sidewalk and curbs, along with a new transformer by BC Hydro.

Our team has also carefully considered the comments provided by the Advisory Design Panel (ADP) on July 24, 2019, the Heritage Advisory Panel (HAP) on August 20, 2019, and Parks comments received on October 15, 2019, along with consideration for the ongoing conversations we have had with Planning, Engineering, and Parks prior to and after our December 5, 2018 submission. To summarize our response:

- Reflectivity: the cladding on the upper level has been refined in consideration of the comments made by the ADP, in order to increase pixilation and additional refraction of light, which creates movement and breaks up the overall volume into smaller-scale components. The design is consistent with the intent of the original Development Permit to create a reflective abstract volume on the top level of the building.
- Views: Views of the mansion are preserved on Wils Spencer Place, Pentrelew Place, and the Asian Garden and enhanced through the open concept, glazing, and new landscaping across the renovation project. New mansion views are provided to compensate for the minor loss of one specific view from Moss Street.
 - A study was conducted to increase views of the mansion on Moss St by changing the shape of the northwest stair tower. This study revealed that only 4% reduction in view loss over the Moss St frontage would be achieved through a substantial volume modification to the stair tower. This modification would significantly negatively impact gallery's operations, negating one of the main purposes of the expansion.
- Landscaping: The gallery has always and continues to be committed to preserving as many existing trees as possible. In challenging instances where there is a need to balance tree preservation with physical accessibility and public access, the gallery has worked closely with the project arborist, community groups and neighbours to propose measures to mitigate impacts to tree health. This is demonstrated through detailed, collaborative efforts as outlined in the attached memo.

The above provides a comprehensive summary of the proposed upgrade to the AGGV and its significance and contextual fit within the urban fabric of Victoria. Further detail on the design, along with the project approvals history, including responses to previous city staff, ADP, and HAP comments regarding the project, have been attached as appendices to this letter and in supporting documents and drawings. We look forward to working with the City and the community as we move forward in this approval process. If there are any questions or additional clarification required for any part of the application, please do not hesitate to contact us.

Sincerely,

HCMA Architecture + Design



Carl-Jan Rupp

ARCHITECT AIBC, SAA, OAA, MRAIC, DIPL-ING. LEED AP

Principal

Appendix 1: Project Design – Written Brief

Project Description

The proposed renewal of the art gallery consists of a partial demolition and renovation of the existing gallery building, along with the addition of two levels above the existing building footprint. Included is also minor interior renovations and exterior restoration work to the Spencer Mansion. The original conceptual design of the project was completed by Lang Wilson Practice in Architecture Culture and Moore Wilson Architects (LWPAC+MW). The current design remains closely aligned with the originally developed ideas. The purpose of the renewal is to increase the AGGV's ability to offer important arts and culture programming to the City of Victoria well into the future. This is accomplished by increasing exhibition, collections, and public gathering areas and improving the performance of the building to meet the operational needs of the facility. Table 1.1 describes the proposed total scope of area increase, and Table 1.2 provides the existing gallery area in comparison.

Table 1.1 Proposed Floor Area Breakdown

LEVEL	GALLERY	MANSION (IN SCOPE)	MANSION (NOT IN SCOPE)
Basement	645m2	-	119m2
Main Floor	1,185m2	89m2	322m2
Level 2	940m2	-	352m2
Level 3	1,070m2	-	185m2
TOTAL	3,840m2	89m2	978m2
TOTAL FLOOR AREA IN GALLERY (NEW AND RENOVATED)			3,840m2
TOTAL FLOOR AREA IN PROJECT SCOPE			3,929m2
ALL FLOOR AREA TOTAL (INCLUDING NOT IN SCOPE MANSION)			4,907m2

Table 1.2 Existing Floor Area Breakdown

LEVEL	EXISTING GALLERY	EXISTING MANSION
Basement	1,090m2	150m2
Main Floor	1,348m2	411m2
Level 2	n/a	352m2
Level 3	n/a	182m2
TOTAL	2,438m2	1,098m2
TOTAL EXISTING FLOOR AREA		3,536m2

Building Program

The AGGV is responsible for a number of much-celebrated events and cultural offerings in the city, such as the annual TD Gallery Paint-In as well as exhibitions of its significant collection of Asian art and artifacts. The renewed gallery aims to improve the public experience of these curated experiences with added exhibition and event space, along with areas for supportive functions such as collections processing and storage.

The basement will primarily be staff area used for the management and storage of collections. The existing loading dock will be relocated further to the south of the property, and the floor area will be increased slightly to accommodate the collections office. Rooms are reconfigured to streamline the delivery and processing of artifacts, decreasing risk to their preservation and maintenance. A portion of the existing basement will be demolished and filled in to allow for the construction of the new lobby above. At the basement level of the mansion, end-of-trip facilities including staff showers and a locker room is anticipated to be a future improvement to the building.

The main floor of the building will include a new fully-glazed lobby complete with a new reception area, 32 seat café, lounge, showcase area, a relocated gift shop, along with a new coat room and office for reception staff. New openings, including a feature bifold door, are provided to create a seamless connection to the outdoor plaza and new garden terrace, increasing the sense of openness and welcome. Connected to the lobby is a new multipurpose space with the ability to be closed off by an operable partition. It also functions as an extension of the lobby when needed. The multipurpose room is also connected to the outdoor through a set of sliding doors to the garden terrace. To support café operation and special events, event storage and a catering kitchen is provided at this level. The main floor will also hold exhibition space and collections storage at the south end of the building. The roof above the collections office has been designated as an area for future expansion at a later date. At the mansion, the children's art studio is currently located within an existing garage space attached to the side of the mansion. This volume will be demolished, and the children's studio will be relocated into the space previously occupied by the gift shop. On the west end of the mansion, minor interior renovations will be completed to create a new staff room and kitchenette.

Level 2 primarily serves back-of-house functions with collections storage, general storage, and mechanical space. Public area on Level 2 consists of a gallery space open to the lobby below. It allows for art exhibition, public programming, observation of activity below and the neighbourhood surroundings, including an unobstructed view to the mansion from the west side. Future expansion of the mansion link is anticipated to connect Level 2 to the 2nd level of the mansion containing the administrative offices of the organization. No other work to the mansion is planned at this time.

The top level (Level 3) of the building is dedicated to two large exhibition spaces. It also includes a lounge and an outdoor sculpture terrace that allows for viewing of the Spencer Mansion from an elevated position. Towards the south end of the building, storage space is allocated in the back-of-house area. Table 1.3 below outlines the area increases for each major category of use at the gallery, excluding existing uses in the mansion.

Site Context

The renewal of the AGGV will be located on its existing site at 1040 Moss St. in the Rockland neighbourhood. Key urban considerations that influenced the development of the design include:

- The facility's unique location that requires striking a balance between accommodating the operational needs of an important cultural institution in the city and respecting the needs of its adjacent neighbours
- Access to the site via walking, cycling, bus transportation, and vehicles
- Primary access to the building via Moss St.
- The natural Garry Oak ecosystem and urban forest in the area
- The make of the area is primarily single family residential with over 80 mansion scale buildings, whose larger volumes supports the increased height of the gallery. The building does not exceed the height of the Spencer Mansion.
- More recent development includes some smaller scale single family homes, as well as multi-unit residential buildings. A 4-storey multi-unit residential building located across the street at 1070 Moss St. The new Bellewood Park development is also under construction close by at 1201 Fort St.
- Other cultural facilities in the neighbourhood: Craigdarroch Castle at 1050 Joan Crescent, Wentworth Villa – Architectural Heritage Museum at 1156 Fort St, Langham Court Theatre at 805 Langham Ct, and the Government House at 1401 Rockland Ave.
- Community amenities in proximity is Central Middle School at 1280 Fort St. and Victoria Fire Hall #1 at 1234 Yates St.

Urban Design Concept

To achieve the AGGV's goal of improving public experience of the gallery, the site has been carefully planned to maximize community connections and to create engaging public spaces while respecting the needs of the neighbourhood. This is realized through use of the following strategies:

- Spatial organization of the site remains largely the same as existing, with some adjustments to improve usage and safety.
- Spencer Mansion is retained, spatially separated from the gallery building and added soft landscaping to honour its original heritage volume.
- The public functions of the facility, including the front entry, lobby, and outdoor plaza, concentrates public activity towards the northeast side of the site, away from residential rear yards.
- Collections and support spaces of the gallery are located towards the south end of the site, adjacent to residential neighbours. Fencing and screening will be constructed to maintain neighbour privacy. Continued and new operational controls will be in place to limit use of the Asian Garden during evenings.
- Windows are used sparingly at the back of the site and at upper levels to limit direct overview into neighbours properties for privacy purposes. This is also beneficial to the gallery's operational requirement to maintain consistent temperature, humidity, and light for the preservation of artifacts.
- The 2-storey lobby and front entry is fully-glazed. The transparency focuses on people and activity in the gallery both during daytime and nighttime. People movement is emphasized with the feature circulation stair located against the glass face along the east face and with view to the new open gallery on Level 2

- The transparent lobby connects directly at ground level to the outdoor plaza and to the Asian Garden terrace, drawing people into the gallery and allowing for engaging activity to spill out across the site
- The main entry is relocated to open towards Moss St, with direct pedestrian access from both the north and south side of Moss St. Pedestrian and cyclist access is prioritized along Moss St.
- Vehicular traffic, including parking lot entry and exit, is redirected to Wilsperner Pl.
- Passenger vehicle drop off is provided on the north side of the site, while bus drop off is provided on the east side along Moss St to accommodate larger groups visiting the gallery
- Loading bay and service functions are located at the south end of the site and screened from public view

Massing

The overall building mass is expressed in a contemporary architectural approach, both reflective of the AGGV's vision of the institution in the future and enhancing the heritage history of the Spencer Mansion through contrast. The two buildings act in conversation with one another, speaking to the AGGV's past and to its future. The new building volume is developed with the following strategies:

- The lobby and public gathering areas are transparent, enclosed with floor to ceiling curtain wall and glass, recessed under the upper galleries, evoking a sense of openness, lightness, and community connection
- The upper galleries is articulated as a pixelated volume that perches above the transparent lobby on tilted steel columns that are an abstraction of tree trunks. It is set within the tree canopy of the existing retained Garry Oaks, cantilevering over the outdoor plaza below to provide shade. The volume is faceted to appear dynamic and visually light, and to catch reflections from its surroundings. The façade is continuous with the soffit and parapet to create the effect of an uninterrupted floating upper volume.
- An inset in the volume corresponds to a large window opening at the top of the interior feature stair where visitors access the upper galleries, to create a curated observation point out into the neighbourhood, while mediating neighbourhood privacy and breaking the length of the upper level along Moss St.
- A playful sculptural stair tower anchors the northwest corner of the building to provide structural support and to contain a fire exit stair, coat room, and staff office. Its form has been studied to minimize obstruction of views to Spencer Mansion.
- The existing gallery building is adaptively reused, serving as the main volumetric anchor for the building on the south side. The added levels extend vertically based on the existing building enclosure, simple in shape, with the upper level on the west side recessed to contain the sculptural terrace and to reduce scale where it is adjacent to residential rear yards.

Exterior Finishes

The exterior finishes of the building responds to its function as a significant public place and its surroundings within a historic residential neighbourhood and urban forest:

- The pixelated volume acts as a feature element of the gallery and will be clad in a reflective brushed aluminum panel. The material reflects and celebrates its immediate surroundings, showing light changes from passing clouds and colour from the sky and adjacent tree foliage, animating the gallery with environmental effects. The brushed finish diffuses light to minimize glare that could impact neighbouring properties.

- The lobby, main entry, and link to the mansion is outfitted with floor-to-ceiling curtain wall and glass to emphasize lightness and openness associated with these public functions. The use of glass also ensures that the Spencer Mansion is in view across the site and within the building.
- The interior feature stair and the edges of the Level 2 open gallery are clad with hemlock wood slats to form a winding and inviting interior volume visible from outside.
- The sculptural stair volume and recessed wall surface under the third level is clad with board form concrete to provide textural interest in its supportive function adjacent to public uses.
- With the prominence of the upper level in shape and finish, the southern portions of the building are clad in fiber cement panels in natural tones and a textured finish to emphasize simplicity in contrast. It is important for the back-of-house spaces of the building to be complementary, but not compete with the third level nor the mansion. This treatment honours the spatial functions of these areas without resorting to mimicry or false articulation.

Streetscape and Landscaping

The streetscape surrounding the property is enhanced through improvement to the landscape and the building's urban strategy:

- The strategies of the lobby described previously in its transparency, relocated main entry, and new door openings serves to visually and physically connect Moss St. to the interior activity of the building
- The building's material palette is chosen to animate the streets with reflectivity, light, texture, and colour
- The new outdoor concrete plaza provides opportunity for public programming that can generate active and passive participation from passersby. Pathways are provided at various locations along Moss St. for direct and accessible travel to the main entrance and plaza.
- Installation of electrical and lighting services extends the use of the lobby to the outdoors and facilitates formal and informal public activities.
- The concrete plaza is also inlaid with permeable pavers to allow water transference to tree roots and to provide visual interest.
- Pathways are edged with a galvanized steel channel with integrated lighting mounted on posts at 300mm high to protect planting and give definition to the pathways and parking areas.
- There are designated locations for public art to be mounted on the building face and locations for freestanding artworks within the site
- The design proposes to preserve 39 trees on site, the majority of which are Garry Oak, and to restore a Garry Oak meadow on site with the replanting of 11 new trees, comprised of Garry Oak and other complementary native species to achieve appropriate tree installation sizes. 4 bylaw-protected trees are slated to be removed due to construction, with 1 additional tree to be removed due to structural concerns.
- New planting beyond the Garry Oak meadow will consist of only west coast vegetation, including kinnickinnick, western sword fern, salal, and rhododendrons.
- A rock outcrop is removed at the edge of the plaza to allow for overflow parking and a drive aisle in the parking lot. AGGV will comply with City of Victoria blasting bylaw. Contractor will consider alternative methods including small blasts and expanding grout.

- New planting is provided in the Asian Garden to mediate grade differences and to increase privacy buffers between the gallery and neighbouring properties.
- Parking stalls are surfaced with permeable pavers to reduce impermeability, water runoff, and risks to tree health.
- A custom bench will be provided for a seating area to encourage lingering on site. The design anticipates the use of reclaimed wood from Garry Oak trees removed from site.

Site Lighting

Lighting design on site is required to ensure the safety of pedestrians, cyclists, and vehicles, to articulate the gallery as a public space, and to maintain security of the building grounds.

- The plaza, parking wheel stops, and pathways will have low ground cover ambient lighting. In the parking lot, lighting posts with a catenary light system will be used to provide adequate lighting for vehicles. Along the edges of the plaza, bollards will be lighted for pedestrian safety.
- Night lighting will include cutoff controls or shades to control lighting within the AGGV property.
- To prevent lighting overspill into the neighbourhood, the lobby lighting will be dimmed down to basic security levels after gallery hours.

Accessibility

Accessibility for the public is provided on site and within the building:

- Access from Moss St. and Wilspencer Pl. to the new lobby and into the Spencer mansion is at one level and is barrier free
- Existing and new galleries and public areas are connected by a new double-sided elevator
- A garden terrace extended from the lobby is provided to allow visitors to observe the Shinto Shrine up close and creates an extension to the Asian Garden without disturbing existing mature trees and plants
- Gender neutral washrooms are provided throughout the facility
- The design anticipates a future addition of a 2nd level on the mansion link to allow access to the upper level of the Mansion's administrative work areas via the double-sided elevator

Safety

The project design follows CPTED principles and safety of the public is a priority for the AGGV:

- The AGGV has successfully managed building and site security on the current property within its residential neighbourhood context.
- Natural surveillance, visibility from the street, access control, lighting, and defensible space are incorporated into the design.
- CCTV, access control, and security systems have been employed holistically across the site to protect the building, grounds, and art collection.
- Vehicular and pedestrian traffic has been separated, with clear entry, exit, and drop off areas established to minimize risks between cars and people
- Paths of travel have been designed to be of sufficient width, of an even surface, and with the most direct route to facilitate pedestrian access across the site

Transportation

Traffic assessment was completed in the original 2015 DP process, and the following items are provided in relation to the transportation strategy:

- Parking meets the AGGV Zone requirement for 26 stalls. The AGGV anticipates continuing its agreements with the Langham Court Theatre and Central Middle School to provide additional parking as required. The previous agreement with the Truth Centre is now defunct due to the sale of the property to Abstract Developments for the new Bellewood Park residences.
- 5 overflow parking stalls are provided close to the building entry. The surfacing will be a continuation of the plaza paving to allow it to be read as public space. When the stalls are not in use, the parking spaces will extend the perceived spaciousness of the plaza. Removable bollards will also be installed to support these dual uses.
- The proposal meets the bike storage requirements per Schedule C. The secure bike storage is proposed to be a simple screen with an overhanging roof and lockable gate, designed to complement the building design.

Heritage

The Spencer Mansion is a significant part of the property, and the renewal of the gallery proposes to maintain the physical visibility and prominence of the heritage building.

- The design retains unobstructed views to Spencer Mansion from Wilspercer, Pentrelew, and the Asian Garden, and provides new views from Moss St and the outdoor plaza through the glazed enclosure of the lobby
- The east façade of the Mansion will be in full view from the lobby allowing the Mansion to be viewed and celebrated as a piece of art and heritage.
- In contrast to the current opaque connection between the galleries and Mansion, the new lobby provides clear visual and physical separation from the mansion to give the mansion back its distinct definition and presence. The proposed separation is 4.5m wide and will be fully glazed. It follows the more successful historic connection to the mansion from 1958.
- The mansion can be viewed from new vantage points from the upper levels of the new building including the sculpture terrace and the open gallery space on Level 2. The dormer and cupola details will be visible at close distance from the sculpture terrace.
- The north elevation of the Mansion will be softened with a new landscape area instead of the asphalt that currently abuts the building façade.
- With the demolition of the existing lobby and relocation of the existing gift shop, the northeast corner of the mansion will be restored to heritage standards.
- The later garage addition to the Mansion, now used as a children's art studio will be removed to return the mansion back to its original volumetric and architectural presence.
- The concrete stair tower in the new gallery building will serve as a critical structural element and means of egress, and it allows for the possibility of the future removal of the more recent exit stair addition to the Mansion's north face, allowing the stained glass feature to be visible both from within and outside of the mansion.

The program and spatial organization of the gallery supports the use of the Spencer Mansion in a more flexible way.

- The new proposed lobby and the great hall of the Spencer Mansion have been designed to operate both as one public space or as separate spaces depending on the gallery's needs.
- The connection between the new gallery building and Mansion is fully glazed and provides total transparency while creating operational functionality to connect the two buildings at the first level.
- The Mansion's ground floor will remain open and accessible to the public.
- With the demolition of the garage addition, the children's art studio is relocated to the current area of the gift shop. It will be rebuilt within the building envelope of the former library, returning the Mansion to its original volume, while improving functionality by placing it immediately adjacent to the public lobby. The gift shop is relocated to the new lobby.

The heritage of the Spencer Mansion is celebrated with additional interpretive material for the public to engage with the history of the city.

- As previously requested from the City, a Statement of Significance has been developed and attached to this application.
- The AGGV will continue to provide public access to the Spencer Mansion and historic interpretive information for its visitors. The new building increases the public's visibility and ease of access to the Mansion.
- The AGGV will consider previous HAP recommendations to provide additional heritage information about the Mansion in new locations including the lobby, plaza, and along the Moss St. frontage.

Building Performance and Sustainable Strategies

High building performance and sustainable development is necessary to serve the current and future needs of the art gallery. The following strategies are incorporated into the facility:

- Adaptive reuse of the existing property, retaining both Spencer Mansion and the gallery building, to reduce the environmental impacts of new construction. Materials from the partial demolition of the building will be salvaged for reuse where possible.
- The facility is designed to meet Class of Control A, as defined by national environmental standards for museums. This standard requires a high-performing building envelope and mechanical system to maintain superior control of temperature and humidity, which benefits both the art collection and occupant comfort.
- Controlled natural ventilation is incorporated in the lobby, using both automated and manual operable windows and glass with low solar heat gain coefficient (SHGC) to reduce mechanical system size and energy use.
- Bike parking for staff and visitors are provided to encourage cycling and reduce vehicle trips to the site. Future renovation of the mansion is planned to include end-of-trip facilities for gallery staff.
- Services will be installed on site for future installation of electric vehicle charging stations in the parking lot.
- The project intends to retain the majority of existing mature trees on site, and where trees are removed, to replant new Garry Oak or complementary native species at a 2:1 ratio, keeping shade present on site and retaining the urban forest characteristic of the Rockland neighbourhood.
- Wood from the removed Garry Oak trees is intended to be reclaimed for a feature bench on site.

- The existing grass lawn will be converted into a native Garry Oak meadow, no longer requiring regular mowing. Native plant material, adapted to the local climatic conditions will be used in the areas that will not be converted to a Garry Oak meadow, reducing the overall watering needs from standard ornamental planting. As the climate changes, native plant material will evolve. The native plant material selected for the site can be found from California to Alaska allowing for resilience to a changing moisture and temperature regime.
- Hard surfaces grade away from the building and permeable paving areas are incorporated into the site; reducing runoff and peak flows during larger storm events

Infrastructure and Services

The project incorporates improvements to existing infrastructure and site services:

- Existing curbs and sidewalks are retained as much as possible to protect existing tree roots. Frontage improvements along Moss St. will occur at Moss/Wilspencer intersection with new crosswalk letdowns, and at the drop off area. At the loading area, frontage improvements will extend approximately one meter from the driveway crossing.
- Water service and storm drainage piping will be upgraded.
- A new BC Hydro transformer will be installed at the south end of the property. It will be screened by soft landscaping planted with west coast vegetation.
- Partial demolition of the existing stone wall and relocation of signage and a utility pole to provide adequate clearance around driveways.
- The driveway at the loading bay will be asphalt to help protect tree roots in the area.

Appendix 2: Approvals History and Responses to Previous Staff Comments

The rezoning process for the renewal of the Art Gallery of Greater Victoria was completed in December 2015, delivered by Lang Wilson Practice in Architecture Culture and Moore Wilson Architects. A Development Permit (DP) was issued at that time. As the project developed, several alterations were made to the design to accommodate the operational needs of the AGGV while remaining strongly aligned with the intent of the approved DP. In December of 2018, the AGGV applied for a Delegated Development Permit (DDP) to reconcile these changes with the original DP. A Building Permit (BP) application was submitted at the same time. Staff review of the DDP indicated that the proposed alterations may exceed the scope of the DDP, and after discussion with staff at Development Services, it was determined that a new Development Permit would be required to move the project forward. The project's BP application remains open until a new DP has been issued. Due to the extensive project history and in the effort to not lose insights and decisions made along the way, Table 2.1 below documents the alterations from the original 2015 design. In Table 2.2, responses to previously-raised staff comments as related to planning, development services, parks, and engineering are provided in order to demonstrate the current design's intent to meet the objectives established in the original DP approval. Table 2.3 documents responses to ADP, HAP, and Parks comments.

Table 2.1: AGGV Development Permit Design Alterations

Item	Alteration	Rationale
Architectural		
A1. Outdoor Terrace	Outdoor terrace & multipurpose room raised from basement to lobby level.	Blasting is reduced in the basement, reducing noise and debris impact to neighbours; universal access provided to the multipurpose room and terrace.
A2. Gas Meter Enclosure	Addition of secure enclosure for the gas meter.	The enclosure is required to protect the gas meter from damage. Enclosure to use material strategy consistent with building design to be visually unobtrusive.
A3. Construction Deleted North of GL-3	Construction has been deleted from the basement north of gridline 3 and existing spaces filled.	Blasting and significant underground work is now avoided in this area of shallow bedrock.
A4. Building Bump Out	Existing volume bump out demolished at L1+2 on the west side of the building.	The building volume is simplified for visual and energy performance benefits. Building pulled back for better delineation between new building and mansion from southwest side.
A5. Concrete Stair Tower Volume	The shape of the concrete stair tower has been simplified.	Volume simplified to aid constructability while maintaining important clearance and view to the mansion.
A6. Link to Mansion	Link to mansion reduced from two storey to one storey.	The reduction is consistent with the design approach to revert the mansion back to the original massing and to better delineate the two structures, though the design allows for possible future expansion of the link to Level 2 for

		universal accessibility to the 2 nd level of the mansion.
A7. Cantilevered Stair Volume	Cantilevered glazed stair volume deleted. Stair to L3 is within 2-storey lobby space.	Building volume is simplified along Moss St. Access to L3 is more connected to activity on ground level while maintaining original intent of visible indoor activity along the street.
A8. Windows Along Moss St. Deleted	Windows at L1 + L3 galleries deleted along east face of building (Moss St side.)	Increased privacy for residential neighbours while improving gallery operations (energy performance and collection preservation).
A9. L3 Floor Area Reduced	Floor area on east side of building reduced. Increased setback from Moss St. at front of building is 11.6m (previous 7.2m). Back of building setback is 7.0m, same as before.	Building construction is moved further back from existing tree canopy, decreasing risk to tree health. Art cloud volume and mass is reduced.
A10. Sculpture Terrace Area Reduced	Sculpture terrace size is reduced, with a more compact area for public access.	Increased privacy for residential neighbours while maintaining original intent to observe mansion from higher vantage point.
A11. Skylights Deleted	Raised triangular skylights deleted from the L3 gallery.	Reduced vertical volume of building while improving gallery operations (energy performance and collection preservation).
A12. Roof access stair enclosure added	Enclosure added to the southwest side of the roof for maintenance access.	Meets gallery's operational needs with minimal visual impact. Height of enclosure to meet previously approved maximum height.
A13. Revised Building Height	Skylights deleted. Art cloud volume height is increased 0.2m from previously approved drawings. Southeast corner of building reduced in height by 7.1m.	Heights revised to allow for the roofing assembly (insulation & membrane), which was not allowed for in previous iteration. Heights are within maximum allowable, and skylight deletion means overall vertical volume is reduced.
A14. Cladding Material Update	Art cloud cladding revised to a reflective brushed aluminum finish. Textured fibre cement and concrete replaces a more industrial palette of polycarbonate and corrugated metal.	Number of different materials reduced, and palette revised in consideration of residential neighbourhood while maintaining original design intent.
Landscape		
L1. Access Path on West Side	Grading revised to accommodate an access path around southwest side of building.	Pedestrian access required for building maintenance. Screening to be provided where grade is raised to maintain privacy.
L2. Asian Garden Renovation Deleted	Existing Asian Garden will be kept as is. Previously proposed renovations deleted from scope.	Less construction and disturbance at west side of building, which is important for neighbour privacy and existing tree retention.

L3. Outdoor Terrace	Terrace moved up to lobby level per item A1.	Increased connection between indoor & outdoor experience, while still allowing for public enjoyment of the Asian Garden.
L4. Transition between New Building & Garden	Proposed soft landscaping at transition from the building to the garden.	Landscaping offers a gradual grade drop to the existing garden, softening the edges of the building.
L5. Plaza Inlay Detail Material Update	Previously proposed wood inlay at the main plaza revised to permeable pavers	Visual interest in the plaza is maintained while allowing tree roots access to water in the plaza area

Table 2.2 Responses to Previous Staff Comments

1.0 DDP – DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIVISION COMMENTS	
Item #	Description & Response
1.1	<p><i>New development is encouraged to add interest to the streetscape through variations in height, rooflines and massing. In addition, new development on corners should contribute to both streetscapes and have a strong relationship to the street. The proposed changes to the upper-storey and removal of the projecting elements and windows along Moss Street is inconsistent with these guidelines.</i></p> <p>The exterior elevations have been rendered with light, shadow, colour, and texture to clarify the variation in building massing and relationship to the neighbourhood in a manner that is consistent with the original design intent. The images show the intended transparencies and reflectivity within the cladding materials that creates visual interest for the streetscape. While the projecting volume has been moved to the interior of the curtain wall, the feature stair is maintained at the building edge along Moss St, where people can be observed across multiple floors, and movement within the building is visible from the street.</p>
1.2	<p><i>Please consider strategies to break up the large building into smaller, human scaled proportions to improve the overall fit with the existing context and provide a more sensitive transition with adjacent, lower density residential development.</i></p> <p>The building volume has been clarified with rendered elevations and renderings where the building is inserted digitally into the street context. Because the design has consistently valued the preservation of the Garry Oak trees on the site, the trees and landscape form an important element of the overall design to tie into the residential area. Similarly, the building is composed of various volumes, now highlighted for clarity, and taller volumes are set back from the street for a sensitive transition to adjacent development. The building height is consistent with what was previously approved.</p>
1.3	<p><i>Large blank windowless and featureless walls that are visible from the public realm are strongly discouraged. Please consider incorporating architectural features that provide pedestrian interest and give further consideration to the location and design of service functions such as the loading area and utility cabinets.</i></p> <p>Pedestrian interest is provided through animation of the glazed lobby, as well as with the art panels that is part of the AGGV's ongoing New Extreme program, working with school-age children to create art that animates Moss St. The material board and elevations have also clarified additional elements that form the exterior material strategy including using materials that have tonal and textural variations, types of window and door openings, and incorporation of glass detailing. The loading area</p>

	is set back from the street, behind a gate, and the BC Hydro transformer will also be located away from the street to emphasize the west coast vegetation and Garry Oak meadow at the site edges.
1.4	<p><i>The design guidelines encourage visually interesting rooflines. The previous design's steel mesh "cloud" was consistent with this guideline and helped to reduce the bulkiness of the upper storey. Please reconsider the proposed changes to the upper storey/roofline. Further to the comment above, please consider alternate materials and material placement to enhance and articulate the street frontages.</i></p> <p>The upper volume as a "cloud" is achieved with abstracted reflection of the sky, trees, the mansion, and the neighbourhood through the use of a reflective metal with a brushed finish. The volume is also faceted to maximize this effect. The look and feel of this has been clarified in the rendered elevations, material board, and context renderings. Visual interest in the roofline is achieved through a material that responds to changing seasons and weather, much like a cloud would. In the summer time, the metal will reflect the green in the Garry Oak canopies. In the winter, when the ground is green and the branches are bare, the metal will reflect the blue sky and the patterned shadows created by the branches. The context renderings of Moss St. looking north and of Pentrelew Place show what the building would look like in February, when the building would be most visible.</p>
2.0 DDP – ENGINEERING AND PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT COMMENTS	
Item #	Description
2.1	<p><i>On site service plan, please show clearance between existing protected trees and new services requested.</i></p> <p>Clearance between existing protected trees and new services has been clarified in the arborist report and in the civil site plan.</p>
3.0 DDP – PARKS DIVISION COMMENTS	
Item #	Description
3.1	<p><i>Please submit an updated arborist report that includes a close review of the current health condition of the existing trees, and exploratory digging where needed with written detailed impacts to all protected trees on and off site affected by the proposed plazas, parking, walkways, new building massing, landscaping, loading bays and site services.</i></p> <p>A revised arborist report as requested is attached.</p>
3.2	<p><i>Arborist report to also include the impacts to site trees from possible rock blasting to remove rock outcrops to build the proposed plaza and driveway.</i></p> <p>Impact from rock blasting has been clarified in attached arborist report. Locations of rock outcrops is surveyed by OPPEL and shown on the site service plan, sheet C101, as well on landscape site plans.</p>
3.3	<p><i>Please consider changing plaza material from concrete to permeable pavers throughout to allow transference of water and nutrients to existing protected trees.</i></p> <p>Concrete paving in the plaza is retained to facilitate public access and gallery programming, which is consistent with the original approved site strategy. As discussed with the city on Feb 19, 2019, we have updated the design to incorporate permeable areas within the plaza to allow for transference of water. As indicated in the arborist report, there is still some risk to tree health, so close monitoring by the arborist will be required during construction. A permeable paving detail will allow water into the lower level at locations scattered throughout the plaza.</p>

3.4	<p><i>Please consider removing or relocating the proposed 21m bench which is in close proximity to bylaw protected trees.</i></p> <p>The bench has been relocated 1m west so that it is located within the footprint of the existing building where root loss is eliminated.</p>
3.5	<p><i>Please consider retaining Garry Oak #274 (Moss Street lawn) and Garry Oak#284 (plaza). These trees are outside of the building envelope, therefore protected under the Tree Preservation Bylaw. Tree tags #286, #287, #295 will need to be removed to achieve the parking lot requirements for this site.</i></p> <p>As requested by the city, the team will seek to retain #274 and #284. Removal of these trees was part of the original approved design. The arborist has noted that retention of #274 may be challenging due to proximity to the building envelope, where clearance pruning may affect overall tree health. The plaza design has been revised to include a landscaped area around #284 for permeability, though the majority of the plaza will be hard-surfaced to facilitate public programming.</p>
3.6	<p><i>Please consider a re-design of the proposed driveway to have one site access, not two, to protect the impacts on the existing Garry Oaks.</i></p> <p>As discussed on site with city staff on Feb 19, 2019, the redesign of the proposed driveway to have one site access is not possible as separate site entrance and exit are required to provide safe travel for vehicles and to meet the minimum parking stall count of 26. It was agreed upon that the design will remain as is.</p>
3.7	<p><i>Please consider removing the proposed walkway from Moss Street between the two protected Sequoia trees. (The BC Hydro transformer is also being relocated from this location to protect these trees.) Alternatively, provide arborist exploratory excavation work that proves this walkway can be built without impacts to these trees.</i></p> <p>A pathway is needed in this area for an exit path from a building egress stair, and there is a strong pedestrian desire line from the south of Moss St. towards the main entrance. The egress stair and pathway are to be level and without tripping hazards to allow for usage by those who have visual or mobility impairment. Where there is anticipated pedestrian use on soft landscaping, providing a formalized path serves to protect root zones by limiting traffic to contained areas. As documented in the arborist report, there will be some impact to the tree roots due to grading constraints and proximity of the tree roots to the surface. Mitigation measures will be to overlap portions of the pathway with where root zones are disturbed from servicing requirements to minimize the number of roots required to be cut, and to raise the grades as much as allowable while maintaining a reasonable slope for accessibility. The arborist will also supervise excavation activity in this area to monitor impacts to tree health.</p>
3.8	<p><i>Provide a tree replacement plan that realistically reflects replacement tree planting sites on the Art Gallery property. Confirm that 11 replacement trees can be planted under the existing canopies and within the root zones of the many existing site trees on this rocky site throughout the parking lot.</i></p> <p>As discussed on site with city staff on Feb 19, 2019, the landscape plan shows the general intent of where replacement trees will best thrive, but exact placement will be determined on site by the design team, arborist, and landscape contractor during construction. Garry Oaks can do well in rocky sites as it is part of their natural environment, and they tend to cluster naturally around adjacent Garry Oaks. Sizes of replacement trees can also be varied to best suit each planting location as smaller trees may adapt better to the site.</p>

4.0 DDP – PERMITS AND INSPECTIONS DIVISION COMMENTS:	
Item #	Description
4.1	<p><i>Firefighting access to the front of the mansion building as per 3.2.5.5</i></p> <p>HCMA and OPPEL met with Brad Sifert on Jan 31, 2019, and it was confirmed that firefighting access to the main building will be on Moss St, and that the fire department will use Pentrelew Place as necessary to access the mansion, which is consistent with current practice. The distance from Moss St. to the main entrance falls just outside of the parameters of the building code due to site constraints, which cannot be met without the loss of existing trees. Brad Sifert confirmed that this is acceptable due to upgrade to the fire alarm and the building being fully sprinklered.</p>
4.2	<p><i>Protection of Stair #1 exit discharge from existing glazing on the mansion building as per 3.2.3.13(3)</i></p> <p>Mansion glazing is located more than 3m horizontally from the Stair #1 exit door. At the link to the mansion, sprinkler-protected glazing is provided to meet the requirements of 3.2.3.13.(3).</p>
4.3	<p><i>Area of refuge (or second stairs) from the upper floor of the mansion building should be provided (as this space is to be occupied by staff & not just a storage area)</i></p> <p>No construction or alteration has been proposed for the upper level of the mansion. Existing fire separations and exit stair enclosures have been clarified on upper level plan.</p>
5.0 DDP – FIRE DEPARTMENT COMMENTS	
Item #	Description
5.1	<p><i>Fire safety plan is required.</i></p> <p>HCMA and OPPEL met with Brad Sifert on Jan 31, 2019, and it was confirmed that a construction fire safety plan will be submitted to the fire department prior to construction mobilization, and an occupant fire safety plan will be submitted at occupancy.</p>
6.0 BP – PARKS COMMENTS	
Item #	Description
6.1	<p><i>Provide an updated arborist report that reflects the current site/tree conditions. Provide more explanation on how the proposed trees will be retained. What are the mitigation measures for the protected trees that will be recommended with regards to proposed newly paved walkways, site furniture, and proposed parking lot? A lot of disturbance will occur to the Garry Oaks in the parking lot. Explain how asphalt will be lifted, removed, and tree roots protected during this demolition.</i></p> <p>Arborist Consultant has discussed current site/trees conditions with Architect, Landscape Consultant, and Civil Consultant. Team has provided mitigation measures and details around demolition, blasting, and protecting existing tree roots. Servicing locations have been revised to minimum potential impact on existing trees/landscape. Arborist has updated arborist report to address Parks' comments. Refer to updated arborist report, A101, L01.1, and C101.</p>
6.2	<p><i>Provide arborist information on building demolition, rock outcrop blasting, and any other structural removals near critical roots of the protected trees. Note all areas that will require rock blasting on landscape plans and provide arborist comments.</i></p> <p>Architectural and landscape site plans have been updated to show extent of demolition and rock blasting. The revised arborist report addresses information requested above. See revised L01.1 and L01.2.</p>

6.3	<p><i>Provide clearance pruning recommendations for the proposed building height for the retained bylaw protected trees.</i></p> <p>Pruning recommendations are provided in the attached arborist report.</p>
6.4	<p><i>Provide construction details for permeable paving proposed between the protected trees.</i></p> <p>Detail of the permeable paving is discussed in the arborist report and in Detail 3 of sheet C301 in the civil drawings. As discussed on site with city staff, landscape will review possible usage of GeoGrid products and other alternatives such as a plastic edge restraint on pavers to minimize excavating into the root zones. A typical plastic edge restraint is provided in Detail 9 of sheet C301 in the civil drawings.</p>
6.5	<p><i>Show replacement trees on landscape plan for the 2:1 ratio as per Tree Preservation Bylaw. Consider rocky site and select best planting sites. This is a very rocky site with many rock outcrops. Can new trees be planted with adequate soil depths and survive in proposed locations?</i></p> <p>As discussed on site with city staff on Feb 19, 2019, the landscape plan shows the general intent of where replacement trees will best thrive, but exact placement will be determined on site by the design team, arborist, and landscape contractor during construction. Garry Oaks can do well in rocky sites as it is part of their natural environment, and they tend to cluster naturally around adjacent Garry Oaks. Sizes of replacement trees can also be varied to best suit each planting location as smaller trees may adapt better to the site.</p>
6.6	<p><i>Garry Oak tag #289 is in a proposed planter. Show how this tree can be retained.</i></p> <p>Existing grade is maintained around this tree. Retention of this tree is described in the updated arborist report and as shown in landscape plans.</p>
6.7	<p><i>Consider converting the Moss St. lawn area to a naturalized meadow with mulch around the base of the 13 retained bylaw protected trees.</i></p> <p>As discussed on site with city staff on Feb 19, 2019, restoring a naturalized Garry Oak meadow is the intent of the landscape design. This is shown in the landscape plans. The intention will be to overseed the lawn areas to limit the disturbance to the root zones of the existing Garry Oak trees.</p>
6.8	<p><i>Consider omitting the proposed walkway through the tree root zones and relocate the bike rack area elsewhere.</i></p> <p>A pathway is needed in this area for an exit path from a building egress stair, and there is a strong pedestrian desire line from the south of Moss St. towards the main entrance. The egress stair and pathway are to be level and without tripping hazards to allow for usage by those who have visual or mobility impairment. Where there is anticipated pedestrian use on soft landscaping, providing a formalized path serves to protect root zones by limiting traffic to contained areas. As documented in the arborist report, there will be some impact to the tree roots due to grading constraints and proximity of the tree roots to the surface. Mitigation measures will be to overlap portions of the pathway with where root zones are disturbed from servicing requirements to minimize the number of roots required to be cut, and to raise the grades as much as allowable while maintaining a reasonable slope for accessibility. The arborist will also supervise excavation activity in this area to monitor impacts to tree health.</p>

6.9	<p><i>Consider planting Garry Oak associated understory species instead of lawn to rehabilitate this area to a healthy Garry Oak meadow (the original landscape of Victoria.)</i></p> <p>As discussed on site with city staff on Feb 19, 2019, restoring a naturalized Garry Oak meadow is the intent of the landscape design. This is shown in the landscape plans and described in item 6.7.</p>
6.10	<p><i>Consider relocating the PMT to another location out of the critical root zone of the two protected Sequoia trees.</i></p> <p>City was amenable to the proposed alternate location immediately adjacent to the south property line by the loading area. This will impact an elm tree on a neighbouring property, but this is preferred to possible impact to mature sequoias. Neighbours will be approached to address concerns with tree impact, and replacement trees can be provided to them if the arrangement is agreeable to them. Design team will move forward with this approach. BC Hydro has confirmed that this location will work for them.</p>
6.11	<p><i>Consider retaining the city sidewalk as-is along Moss St. frontage to avoid disturbance to Garry Oak roots immediately adjacent to the sidewalk.</i></p> <p>Design intent is to maintain existing curbs and sidewalks as much as possible to protect existing tree roots. Frontage improvements along Moss St. will occur at Moss/Wilspencer intersection and at the drop off area. At the loading area, frontage improvements will extend approximately one meter from the driveway crossing. All remaining frontage along Moss St to remain as existing. Extent has been clarified in design drawings. City was amenable to this approach.</p>
6.12	<p><i>Consider driveway redesign to one entrance/exit to lessen the impacts to retained protected trees.</i></p> <p>As discussed on site with city staff on Feb 19, 2019, the redesign of the proposed driveway to have one site access is not possible as separate site entrance and exit are required to provide safe travel for vehicles and to meet the minimum parking stall count of 26. It was agreed upon that the design will remain as is.</p>
6.13	<p><i>Provide a detailed landscape grading plan that notes proposed grades. Ideally, existing grades will be maintained so that protected tree root zones are not disturbed, i.e. loading bay and Sequoia.</i></p> <p>Grades provided on the civil plan sheet C101 match the proposed landscape grading plan. Existing grades are also shown on the civil plans. Existing and proposed grades have been included on the landscape drawings for the non-vehicular on-site hard landscape areas. Design intent is to maintain existing grades on site as much as possible. Any grade changes will be made clear on drawings for city's review.</p>

7.0 BP – ENGINEERING TRANSPORTATION COMMENTS

Item #	Description
7.1	<p><i>Extents of frontage improvements TBD based on utility servicing. If more than 50% of sidewalk frontage impacted then full frontage improvements required (sidewalk, boulevard, curb, and gutter replaced.)</i></p> <p>Design intent is to maintain existing curbs and sidewalks as much as possible to protect existing tree roots. Frontage improvements along Moss St. will occur at Moss/Wilspencer intersection and at the drop off area. At the loading area, frontage improvements will extend approximately one meter from the driveway crossing. All remaining frontage along Moss St to remain as existing. Extent has been clarified in design drawings. City was amenable to this approach to prioritize tree preservation.</p>

7.2	<p><i>Proposed driveway crossing types to be as follows (see Schedule B of the Highway Access Bylaw.): Moss St. to conform to Type B (width min. 5m, max. 7m, double 1m flares at curb.) Entrance and exit driveway crossings on Wilsperner to conform to Type A (width min. 3.5m, max. 4.5m, 1.5m flares at curb)</i></p> <p>Driveway dimensions are shown on civil plans sheets C101 and C201. The entrance on Wilsperner is 3.5m in width, the exit on Wilsperner is 4.5m in width. The driveway on Moss Street is 7.0m wide with 1m flares. As discussed with the city, an asphalt driveway will be provided at the loading area to minimize impact to tree roots.</p>
7.3	<p><i>Show restoration of full height curb, boulevard, and sidewalk at Moss St. (north) redundant driveway crossing on civil plans. Ensure architectural, civil, and landscape plans match (landscape shows full restoration).</i></p> <p>Full restoration is expected at the drop off area. Refer to revised sheet C201.</p>
7.4	<p><i>The city has updated specifications for wheelchair ramps (lip and trowel spacing). Proposed ramps at Moss and Wilsperner to be as per STD DWG C9MOD (details can be provided to applicant.)</i></p> <p>Specification detail is noted on civil drawings Detail 8 on sheet C301.</p>
7.5	<p><i>Minimum 1.2m horizontal clearance required from driveway crossing edges to any surface infrastructure (utility poles, signs, hydrants, etc.) Show dimensioned relocations of parking signs and utility pole to minimum clearance on plans.</i></p> <p>Utility pole at Wilsperner entry will be moved further west to maintain clearance. The 2.0m clearance is noted on sheet C101 and also in Construction Note #20.</p>
7.6	<p><i>Please demonstrate that the 3m sight triangles on each side of the driveway crossings has been achieved on the plans. Site triangles are provided at the property boundary and are located within private property. They provide intervisibility between motorists using the driveway and people walking on the sidewalk (See Schedule C in the Highway Access Bylaw.)</i></p> <p>At Wilsperner, additional portions of existing stone wall to be demolished to maintain sight triangles. Civil plans sheet C101 and landscape site plans show the 3m sight triangles on all driveway crossings. Refer to Construction Note #18 and #25 on sheet C101.</p>
8.0 BP – ENGINEERING UNDERGROUND COMMENTS	
Item #	Description
8.1	<p><i>Please show new 150mm Storm Drain out of proposed driveway. Consider installing service in common trench with other 150mm SS and SD – Comment 22 should be directed to Underground Operations regarding maintenance to water vault.</i></p> <p>Revised civil drawings sheet C101 shows the 150mm Storm Drain to be installed via pipe bursting method to replace existing 100mm storm drain. Refer to Construction Notes #5 and #6.</p>

Table 2.3 - Responses to ADP, HAP, and Parks Comments

1.0 DPA – ADVISORY DESIGN PANEL COMMENTS	
Item #	Description & Response
1.1	<p><i>Further consideration of the materiality, including the reflectivity and connection detailing of the upper cloud element (roof).</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reflectivity <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Using a reflective metal with a brushed natural finish, interest and lightness of the upper volume of the art gallery is achieved with the abstracted reflection of the sky, trees, the mansion, and the neighbourhood. ○ The overall volume is faceted to maximize this effect. ○ The level of reflectivity has been chosen to respond to changes in colour and shadow as seasons change, which contributes to making the volume appear lighter. A loss in reflectivity would increase the perceived weight of the volume. • Connection Detailing: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ To manage light, to further break up the surfaces, and to add an element of movement as suggested by design panel members, we now propose to divide the volume into square panels that additionally facet in different directions in a randomized pattern. Doing so reduces continuous surfaces down to 1.5m x 1.5m panels. • The multiple directional changes of the panels will create variances in the colour tones of the finish, which will change throughout the day. • <i>Exhibit: A rendering and updated elevations have been provided to illustrate the refined cladding concept.</i>
1.2	<p><i>Reconsideration of the northwest stair tower</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The shape and orientation of the stair tower has been carefully studied to manage views to the mansion while meeting the structural, operational, and safety needs of the art gallery. • The stair tower serves as a fire exit for both the new gallery and the mansion, and in the future, would allow a retrofit to demolish a stair exit built in the 1990's and to return the north elevation back to original heritage features. • The mansion remains fully visible from Wilspencer, Pentrelew, and the Asian Garden. • Loss of mansion roof views on Moss St is compensated by mansion views through the glazed lobby from street level, as well as new close-up views of the mansion in the lobby and café. • Rotating the stair tower is not possible, due to the need for a structural shear wall in the north-south direction. • We have studied a reduction in the length of the tower. The reduction we were able to achieve within structural constraints creates an additional glimpse of the mansion along Moss St. by approximately four meters. This translates to 4% reduction in view loss over the entire Moss St frontage. • However, this small increase in view significantly impacts the gallery's operation by reducing the size of the Visitor Services office by 50%, impacting the ability of staff to properly manage the lobby. • The gallery estimates that the Mansion view loss (mansion as full volume) would impact less than 10% of visitors. Anyone driving in, including bicycles, would enter via Wilspencer where the full view of the mansion would be available to them. People who walk to the Art Gallery or take a bus from downtown, approach the building via Fort St.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Exhibit: An impact plan has been provided in the drawing that illustrates the extent of possible views of the mansion across the entire property.</i>
1.3	<p><i>Serious consideration to retain the trees identified as "to be determined", especially those in the parking lot and those located on adjacent properties.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The gallery recognizes the value of the trees to the neighbourhood and the city and is committed to preserving as many trees on site as possible. With further investigation completed by the project arborist, the list of trees retained and removed has been clarified, including those on neighbouring properties. A conservative approach has been taken to clarifying this list, as there are a number of unknowns until construction begins. There is a possibility of retaining certain trees currently listed as remove, as noted in the arborist report. The arborist will investigate at time of excavation to confirm feasibility. The neighbours at 1010 Moss St have been made aware of potential impact to their existing trees. • Unknowns will remain around the extensiveness of tree roots in proximity to the existing gallery building until construction begins; therefore, the project arborist will be present on site to observe site conditions and provide guidance around minimizing impact to trees. All proposed measures are detailed in the attached arborist report. • Because the parking stalls fall within the critical root zones of the Garry Oaks, permeable paving will be used for the stalls and ground screws are being proposed to anchor the supports for the overhead wires and catenary lighting. Careful hydrovac excavation will be used to explore any work that cuts into the existing grades within the critical root zones of the trees. Minor modifications are expected to the locations of the lights and support stakes for the metal edges. • An existing Garry Oak tree will be retained in the middle of the plaza to provide shade and preserve the character of the corner. Permeable paving strips will allow water to drop down to a breathable layer of gravel over the root zones below the paved areas. • <i>Exhibit: a revised arborist report has been provided detailing additional investigation and tree retention/removal, along with the approach to tree preservation, as discussed in multiple meetings and ongoing correspondence with Parks and Engineering as well as with neighbours since the initial submission on Dec 5, 2018. Previous meeting records and responses to Parks submitted during the application process have also clarified the gallery's intent in preserving trees while ensuring that the needs of a significant cultural facility and public amenity are met. Attached is also a letter of confirmation from the neighbours at 1010 Moss St. that they are aware of the impact construction may have on their existing trees.</i>
1.4	<p><i>Inclusion of a landscape strategy for the establishment of the implementation of the Garry Oak meadow.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The existing Garry Oak trees will provide the overall structure for the ecosystem. Some native meadow plants have already established in the existing lawn, but new introductions will be required up front and over the next few years to transition the lawn areas. New Garry Oak trees will be planted to allow for succession of the existing trees. Only meadows and trees are proposed for the site, as view lines are to be kept open to address CPTED considerations. • The team has reached out to the Garry Oak Ecosystems Recovery Team to ensure the method is appropriate and feasible for the site. • Strategy for a Garry Oak meadow: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Lawns to be converted into Garry Oak meadows. ○ Instruct contractor to not over seed the existing lawn areas. This has been proven not to work. ○ Select bulbs and grasses from list provided in Garry Oak Gardener's Handbook.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Final selections to be made in consultation with Parks staff ○ Install as described in Garry Oak Gardener's Handbook. ○ There is currently a section of lawn along Wilspercer that has been continually managed to support spring camas production; this will continue to occur during and after the renovation project. • Strategy for tree planting: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Tree removals will be replaced with Garry Oaks in a variety of locations on site to plan for succession of the Garry Oak meadow. ○ Select locations and verify on site to ensure there is sufficient soil in those locations. ○ The trees will be planted at a small size to allow for the trees to grow into their environment the root structures to work around the rocks. Young seedlings have proven to yield the best results. ○ Final size to be confirmed with Parks staff • Strategy for tree protection: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Tree protection fencing and root zone monitoring will be in place during construction as outlined. ○ Garry Oak Meadow to be protected with a low metal barrier. ○ Install signage to interpret the recreated ecosystem.
2.0 DPA – HERITAGE ADVISORY PANEL COMMENTS	
Item #	Description & Response
2.1	<p><i>Consider design refinements that would "conserve" the concentration of character-defining elements as viewed from Moss. St.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There will be changes to the views of the mansion on Moss St. given the new project addresses the gallery's need to expand available exhibition and collections space to continue serving the public. • The expansion provides the opportunity for new and alternative ways for visitors and the larger community to experience the mansion and its connection to the new gallery. The open concept connection between the mansion and the addition is the single largest improvement upon the existing facility that not only conserves, respects and but enhances the heritage connection. • Currently, the mansion in its character-defining volume is experienced across the north 30% of the street frontage. An additional 30% of the frontage offers views of only the mansion roof, with the existing building blocking the view from the eaves down to the ground. The mansion is currently not visible along the remaining street frontage at the south. • The addition to the building will result in no loss in existing views at the south of Moss St. It may result in a loss of existing views across the 30% Moss St. frontage with roof views and loss of half of the existing views at the north equivalent to 15% of the Moss St frontage. • As some view loss is anticipated, the strategy to preserve as many views of the mansion as possible and to compensate for loss of views include the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The mansion remains fully visible from Wilspercer, Pentrelew, and the Asian Garden ○ The west side of the existing building is demolished to create an outdoor terrace that increases space in the Asian Garden to appreciate the mansion and all its character-defining elements. ○ The lobby is fully glazed, allowing for never-before-available mansion views at street level on Moss St as well as close-up views in the new café and lobby. ○ The mansion can also be viewed from new vantage points from the upper levels of the new building including the sculpture terrace and the open gallery space on Level 2. The dormer and cupola details will be visible at close distance from the sculpture terrace.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The views at the terrace, café, lobby, and sculpture terrace will be of better quality than the existing roof-only views on Moss St. • Comments from item 1.2 in the previous section are applicable in consideration of preserving mansion views around the northwest stair tower. • The mansion will now be framed through the new gallery, celebrating it as an important piece of art and heritage in the neighbourhood. • The heritage preservation approach to the gallery is holistic, as the design increases the gallery's street presence and welcomes visitors to appreciate the mansion from up close. Sensitivity to the mansion is also through the following strategies: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Creating a 4.5m physical separation between the mansion and new building to establish the mansion as a distinct building and presence. ○ Restoring the northeast corner of the mansion to heritage standards ○ Softening the edges of the mansion with landscaping instead of asphalt • As noted above, visitors driving in, including bicycles, would enter via Wilspercer where the full view of the mansion is available. People who walk to the Art Gallery or take a bus from downtown also approach the building via Fort St. • <i>Exhibit: An impact plan has been provided in the drawing that illustrates the extent of possible views of the mansion across the entire property.</i>
2.2	<p><i>Consider heritage designation for the mansion for AGGV</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The AGGV has contemplated heritage designation for the Spencer Mansion numerous times over the years under the guidance of a variety of Boards. • The AGGV decided to register the mansion on the Heritage Registry; however, the current Board is open to reviewing the decision for designation.
3.0 DPA – PARKS COMMENTS	
Item #	Description & Response
3.1	<p><i>Offsite trees with critical root zones (CRZs) extending onto the subject lot need to be legally surveyed and the accurate locations shown on the Site Plan and Landscape Plan.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A legal survey of protected/listed trees on neighbouring lots will be provided prior to the start of construction.
3.2	<p><i>To promote the retention of giant sequoia trees #261 and #263, it is strongly advised that the servicing and building footprint to the west of the trees be redesigned, so that the area where excavation is required does not extend beyond the existing building.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Servicing along the east face of the building will be stacked and routed as close to the foundation walls as possible in order to minimize impacts to the sequoias. The arborist will also be on site to supervise excavation during construction. The building footprint has not changed from the design that was originally approved in 2015. It is not possible to redesign the approved footprint, which houses art collections storage and management, without severely jeopardizing the gallery's ability to operate and the premise for undertaking this construction.

3.3	<p><i>Parks does not support the southerly paved pathway from Moss St. leading to the bike racks due to anticipated root loss and negative impacts to giant sequoias #261 and #263.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> As discussed with Parks on Feb 19, 2019, an accessible pathway is provided in this area to meet pedestrian desire lines from south Moss towards the main entrance. To meet accessibility standards, the allowable slope percentage meant cutting into the existing grade around the trees, negatively impacting the tree roots that are close to the surface. After further review, the team has decided to raise the grade of the pathway above existing grade by 200mm to minimize root loss to the sequoias. This means that a portion of this path will not be fully accessible, and the main accessible route will be on the North side of Moss St. Where the pathway meets existing grade, the location will match where servicing enters the property to minimize root loss.
3.4	<p><i>Per the Arborist Report, it is strongly recommended that no-dig and permeable surfacing be utilized for all hard surfaces proposed within tree CRZs.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Concrete paving is provided in the plaza to meet the programmatic needs of the art gallery for public access and improved accessibility, while permeable pavers are placed where they will have the highest impact to the landscape. It also creates much-needed definition between the parking lot and pedestrian zones. In discussion with Parks staff on Feb 19, 2019, the design was updated to incorporate permeable areas within the plaza to allow for transference of water. Permeable paving strips will allow water to drop down to a breathable layer of gravel over the root zones below the paved areas. The plaza grades have also been designed to be raised above tree roots as much as possible while meeting accessibility requirements for slopes and level ground.
3.5	<p><i>The proposed alignment of the path from the Moss St. Drop Off Area will negatively impact tree #277. It is strongly recommended that the alignment of the existing driveway be utilized to promote preservation of #277.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The alignment of the path from Moss St. corresponds to moving the main entrance of the gallery from its existing location on Wils Spencer Place to Moss St. The new location of the entrance improves on pedestrian access to the gallery and minimizes conflicts between pedestrians and cars by creating separation from the parking lot. The alignment follows best practices for wayfinding and accessibility by having a physical path match what visitors see as they approach from the drop off area on Moss. Following the alignment of the existing driveway would lead pedestrians away from the main entrance instead of towards it. This would cause people to cut across soft-landscaped areas slated to become Garry Oak meadow to access the main entry, creating frustration for pedestrians and damaging landscaped areas in the process.
3.6	<p><i>To limit impacts to tree #277, please reduce the extent of paving adjacent to the Drop Off Area on Moss St. to match the width of the path opening at the sidewalk.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> As a public institution and tourist destination, the drop-off area on Moss St is provided for tour buses with a larger volume of people. These tour buses will be approaching from Fort St. The extent of paved surface as indicated is to accommodate expected vehicle lengths and the volume of people who would need to enter and exit a tour bus at this location. In some cases, there may be more than one exit point from the vehicle. Tour buses will not access Wils Spencer Place or enter the parking lot in order to minimize any conflict with pedestrians, cyclists, and passenger vehicles.

3.7	<p><i>Trees listed with a retention status of "TBD" need to be identified as either "Retain" or "Remove." If exploratory excavations are required to get a better understanding of potential impacts to bylaw-protected trees, a Tree Permit will be required.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Following additional exploratory excavations undertaken by the arborist, trees in the table provided in the arborist report have been updated as retain or remove. A full description of findings has been provided in detail in the arborist report. • Under arborist supervision, the design team will attempt to retain a number of trees noted as remove, particularly those on neighbouring properties. These trees have been identified in the arborist report. • <i>Exhibit: Revised arborist report has updated list of trees.</i>
3.8	<p><i>Tree #289 – Please review the impact from proposed blasting in the vicinity.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction will follow the blasting recommendations as outlined in the arborist report to minimize impact to all trees slated for retention on the property. The arborist does not anticipate significant impact to tree #289 from blasting. • <i>Exhibit: Revised arborist report provides clarification on anticipated blasting impact to trees.</i>
3.9	<p><i>Tree #305 – provide information regarding impacts and recommendations for installation of new retaining walls in the Asian Garden, on the west side of the main building.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Significant root loss is not anticipated to #305 in the Asian Garden from the retaining walls, which are designed to meet the elevation of rock retaining walls in the existing patios at a lower level. Some paving from the patios will be removed, and new shrubs will be planted. • <i>Exhibit: Revised arborist report provides clarification on anticipated impact to #305 from new retaining walls in the Asian Garden.</i>
3.10	<p><i>In addition to trees already indicated as bylaw-protected, identify any trees over 60 cm as bylaw-protected.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All trees over 60cm has been identified as bylaw-protected in the tree table provided in the arborist report.
3.11	<p><i>Owners of neighbouring properties, 1035 Pentrelew and 1010 Moss, need to be informed of potential impacts to trees on their property. Signed authorization from the property owner(s) must be provided to the City for any trees that are proposed for removal from their properties.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Based on additional exploratory work, the arborist has confirmed that trees at 1035 Pentrelew can be retained. The neighbours at 1010 Moss St. are aware that trees on their property are impacted by construction, though every effort will be taken to retain as many existing trees as possible. • <i>Exhibit: Written confirmation has been obtained from the neighbours at 1010 Moss St. and attached to this memo.</i>

3.12	<p><i>It is strongly recommended that a Tree Pruning Permit be obtained ASAP from Parks to mitigate conditions of concern identified by the Project Arborist. Priority pruning should be done on Garry oaks #278 - #282.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Permits have been arranged for this pruning to be undertaken. • <i>Exhibit: Pruning permit is attached to this memo.</i>
------	--