I. REPORTS OF COMMITTEES

I.1 Committee of the Whole

- I.1.a Report from the June 6, 2019 COTW Meeting
 - I.1.a.a 902, 906 & 910 McClure Street (Abigail's Hotel) Rezoning Application No. 00648, Development Permit with Variance Application No. 000530, & Heritage Designation Application No. 00181 (Fairfield)

Moved By Councillor Thornton-Joe Seconded By Councillor Loveday

Rezoning Application No. 00648

That Council instruct staff to prepare the necessary Zoning Regulation Bylaw Amendment that would authorize the proposed development outlined in Rezoning Application No. 00648 for 902, 906 and 910 McClure Street, that first and second reading of the Zoning Regulation Bylaw Amendment be considered by Council and a Public Hearing date be set once the following condition is met:

1. Preparation and execution of a legal agreement to secure a 1.83m Statutory Right-of Way along Quadra Street, to the satisfaction of the Director of Engineering and Public Works.

Development Permit with Variance Application No. 000530

That Council, after giving notice and allowing an opportunity for public comment at a meeting of Council, and after the Public Hearing for Rezoning Application No. 00648, if it is approved, consider the following motion:

"That Council authorize the issuance of Development Permit with Variance Application No. 000530 for 902, 906 and 910 McClure Street, in accordance with:

- 1. Plans date stamped March 5, 2019.
- 2. Development meeting all Zoning Regulation Bylaw requirements, except for the following variance:
 - i. reduce the minimum landscape strip for a surface parking lot from 1.0m to 0.67m.
- 3. The Development Permit lapsing two years from the date of this resolution."

Heritage Designation Application No. 00181

1. That Council instruct staff to prepare the necessary Heritage Designation Bylaw that would approve the designation of the heritage-registered property located at 906 McClure Street, pursuant to Section 611 of the *Local Government Act*, as a Municipal Heritage Site, and that first and second reading of the

Heritage Designation Bylaw be considered by Council and a Public Hearing date be set.

2. That Council authorize the Mayor and City Clerk to execute documents necessary to discharge Covenant #88497 in the form satisfactory to the City Solicitor from the property's title once the Heritage Designation Bylaw is approved.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

F.1 <u>902, 906 & 910 McClure Street (Abigail's Hotel) - Rezoning Application No.</u> <u>00648, Development Permit with Variance Application No. 000530 &</u> Heritage Designation Application No. 00181 (Fairfield)

Committee received a report dated May 9, 2019 from the Acting Director of Sustainable Planning and Community Development proposing to construct a fourstorey hotel building at 910 McClure Street while retaining the two existing hotel buildings at 902 and 906 McClure Street, including designating the building at 906 McClure Street as heritage.

Moved By Councillor Loveday Seconded By Councillor Isitt

Rezoning Application No. 00648

That Council instruct staff to prepare the necessary Zoning Regulation Bylaw Amendment that would authorize the proposed development outlined in Rezoning Application No. 00648 for 902, 906 and 910 McClure Street, that first and second reading of the Zoning Regulation Bylaw Amendment be considered by Council and a Public Hearing date be set once the following condition is met:

 Preparation and execution of a legal agreement to secure a 1.83m Statutory Right-of Way along Quadra Street, to the satisfaction of the Director of Engineering and Public Works.

Development Permit with Variance Application No. 000530

That Council, after giving notice and allowing an opportunity for public comment at a meeting of Council, and after the Public Hearing for Rezoning Application No. 00648, if it is approved, consider the following motion:

"That Council authorize the issuance of Development Permit with Variance Application No. 000530 for 902, 906 and 910 McClure Street, in accordance with:

- 1. Plans date stamped March 5, 2019.
- 2. Development meeting all *Zoning Regulation Bylaw* requirements, except for the following variance:
 - i. reduce the minimum landscape strip for a surface parking lot from 1.0m to 0.67m.

Heritage Designation Application No. 00181

1. That Council instruct staff to prepare the necessary Heritage Designation Bylaw that would approve the designation of the heritage-registered property located at 906 McClure Street, pursuant to Section 611 of the *Local Government Act*, as a Municipal Heritage Site, and that first and second reading of the Heritage Designation Bylaw be considered by Council and a Public Hearing date be set.

Committee of the Whole Minutes, June 6, 2019

2. That Council authorize the Mayor and City Clerk to execute documents necessary to discharge Covenant #88497 in the form satisfactory to the City Solicitor from the property's title once the Heritage Designation Bylaw is approved.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Committee of the Whole Minutes, June 6, 2019



Committee of the Whole Report For the Meeting of June 6, 2019

То:	Committee of the Whole	Date:	May 9, 2019
From:	Andrea Hudson, Acting Director, Sustain	able Planning and	Community Development

Subject: Rezoning Application No. 00648 for 902, 906 and 910 McClure Street

RECOMMENDATION

That Council instruct staff to prepare the necessary Zoning Regulation Bylaw Amendment that would authorize the proposed development outlined in Rezoning Application No. 00648 for 902, 906 and 910 McClure Street, that first and second reading of the Zoning Regulation Bylaw Amendment be considered by Council and a Public Hearing date be set once the following condition is met:

 Preparation and execution of a legal agreement to secure a 1.83m Statutory Right-of-Way along Quadra Street, to the satisfaction of the Director of Engineering and Public Works.

LEGISLATIVE AUTHORITY

In accordance with Section 479 of the *Local Government Act*, Council may regulate within a zone the use of land, buildings and other structures; the density of the use of the land, building and other structures; the siting, size and dimensions of buildings and other structures; as well as the uses that are permitted on the land, and the location of uses on the land and within buildings and other structures.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to present Council with information, analysis and recommendations for a Rezoning Application for the properties located at 902, 906 and 910 McClure Street. The proposal is to rezone from the T-7 Zone, Bessborough Transient Accommodation District, and the R-K Zone, Medium Density Attached Dwelling District, to a new site-specific transient accommodation zone to allow Abigail's Hotel to construct a new four-storey hotel building at 910 McClure Street while retaining the two existing hotel buildings at 902 and 906 McClure Street. The proposal also includes a Heritage Designation Application for the building at 906 McClure Street. The concurrent Development Permit with Variance application seeks to vary the landscape screening requirements for surface parking lots.

The following points were considered in assessing this application:

 the proposal is generally consistent with the Official Community Plan (OCP, 2012) Urban Residential Urban Place Designation, which envisions visitor accommodation in preexisting locations and buildings with residential street character

- the proposal is consistent with the *Humboldt Valley Precinct Plan*, which allows for small expansions to existing visitor accommodation uses where they can be accommodated with minimal intrusion on surrounding residential uses
- the proposed heritage designation of the building at 906 McClure Street is consistent with the OCP's place-making objectives which encourage the preservation and conservation of buildings with heritage merit
- one bylaw-protected holly tree would be removed and replaced with two trees consistent with the Tree Preservation Bylaw
- the provision of a 1.83m Statutory Right-of-Way (SRW) along Quadra Street helps to achieve a standard Right-of-Way width for a secondary arterial roadway for future road improvements.

BACKGROUND

Description of Proposal

This Rezoning Application is to allow Abigail's Hotel to construct a new, four-storey hotel building at 910 McClure Street while retaining the two existing hotel buildings at 902 and 906 McClure Street.

The following differences from the standard T-1 Zone, Limited Transient Accommodation District, are being proposed and would be accommodated in the new zone:

- reducing the maximum floor space ratio from 1.2:1 to 0.64:1
- reducing the maximum height from 21.5m to 10.55m
- reducing the minimum interior side yard setback from 7.5m to 3.5m
- reducing the minimum building separation from 18.0m to 4.0m
- reducing the minimum open site space from 30% to 27%.

Tenant Assistance Policy

The proposal is to demolish the existing single family dwelling, which would result in a loss of one residential unit which is currently rented. Consistent with the Tenant Assistance Policy, the applicant has provided a Tenant Assistance Plan which is attached to this report.

Sustainability Features

The applicant has identified a number of sustainability features which will be reviewed in association with the concurrent Development Permit Application for this property.

Active Transportation Impacts

The application proposes the following features which support active transportation:

- six long-term bicycle parking stalls
- six short-term bicycle parking stalls.

Public Realm Improvements

No public realm improvements are proposed in association with this Rezoning Application.

Accessibility Impact Statement

The British Columbia Building Code regulates accessibility as it pertains to buildings. The proposed covered ramp between the buildings at 906 and 910 McClure Street is designed to improve on-site accessibility for guests.

Land Use Context

The area is characterized by low-rise residential buildings with multiple dwelling units, house conversions, duplexes and single-family dwellings. The adjacent property to the north (913 Burdett Avenue) is heritage-designated. Other heritage-designated properties in the immediate area include 730 Quadra Street, 924 McClure Street, and 917, 923, 929 and 999 Burdett Avenue.

Existing Site Development and Development Potential

The current Abigail's Hotel site (902 and 906 McClure Street) is currently developed with two hotel buildings consisting of 23 guestrooms under the site-specific T-7 Zone, Bessborough Transient Accommodation District.

The property located at 910 McClure Street is currently developed as a two-storey, single-family dwelling which is currently rented and partially utilized by the hotel for storage. Under the current R-K Zone, the property could be developed as a triplex.

Data Table

The following data table compares the proposal with the T-1 Zone, Limited Transient Accommodation District. An asterisk is used to identify where the proposal is less stringent than the existing zone. A double asterisk is used to identify existing legal non-conformities.

Zoning Criteria	Proposal	T-1 Zone	OCP Policy Urban Residential
Site area (m²) – minimum	2177.17	1850	N/A
Density (Floor Space Ratio) – maximum	0.64:1	1.2:1	1.2:1 (base) 2.0:1 (maximum)
Height (m) – maximum	10.53	21.50	-
Storeys – maximum	4	N/A	6
Site coverage (%) – maximum	28	30	
Open site space (%) – minimum	27 *	30	-
Setbacks (m) – minimum		ų.	
Front	1.63 ** (building at 902 McClure Street) 9.77 (new building)	7.5	-
Rear (north)	11.19	7.5	· · ·

Zoning Criteria	Proposal	T-1 Zone	OCP Policy Urban Residential
Side (east)	3.50 *	7.5	-
Side (Quadra Street)	0.67 **	7.5	-
Vehicle parking – minimum	17	16	
	4 ** (small car stalls)	-	-
Parking landscape screen (m) – minimum	0.67 *	1.0	-
Bicycle parking stalls – minimum			
Long term	6	2	-
Short term	6	1	-

Community Consultation

Consistent with the *Community Association Land Use Committee (CALUC) Procedures for Processing Rezoning and Variance Applications*, the applicant has consulted the Fairfield Gonzales CALUC at a Community Meeting held on April 12, 2018. The meeting minutes are attached to this report.

ANALYSIS

Official Community Plan

The Official Community Plan (OCP, 2012) identifies the site as being located in the Urban Residential Urban Place Designation, which envisions low-rise and mid-rise buildings up to approximately six storeys with total floor space ratios generally up to 1.2:1. Place character features include variable setbacks with doors facing the street, front yard landscaping, street tree planting and collective driveway access to rear yard or underground parking. Visitor accommodation use is envisioned in pre-existing locations. Although the application would expand the current visitor accommodation use of Abigail's Hotel to include 910 McClure Street, the proposal is considered generally consistent with the Urban Residential designation as it would preserve and enhance the residential and heritage character of the street and is consistent with the density, height and place character features identified for this designation. Furthermore, the proposed heritage designation of 906 McClure Street and the sympathetic siting and design of the new building at 910 McClure Street would preserve and strengthen the heritage character of the area.

Local Area Plans

The *Humboldt Valley Precinct Plan* designates 902 and 906 McClure Street as Apartment Residential with density up to 1.6:1 FSR. The property at 910 McClure Street is designated as

General Residential with density up to 0.6:1 FSR. The Plan anticipates redevelopment at 910 McClure Street and minimal change at 902 and 906 McClure Street. The Plan also envisions expansion of existing visitor accommodation uses where they do not negatively impact the existing residential character of the area. The proposal is considered generally consistent with these policies, as well as those that encourage the preservation of heritage properties. While the proposed 0.64:1 FSR exceeds the maximum density envisioned for 910 McClure Street, it is well within the density envisioned in the OCP, which provides more current policy direction for land use and growth across the City.

Tree Preservation Bylaw and Urban Forest Master Plan

There were thirteen trees assessed by the project arborist, Talbot and Mackenzie, as potentially impacted by the proposed development. A 30cm diameter at breast height (DBH) mountain-ash tree would be retained on the McClure Street boulevard with this application. Six privately-owned trees were inventoried and five trees would require removal, as they fall within the building envelope of the new building at 910 McClure Street or are located immediately adjacent to the proposed pedestrian ramp and cannot be retained. There are two Western hemlock trees (37 and 39cm DBH) and one English elm stump. One bylaw-protected English holly tree (80cm DBH) would also require removal as it falls within the building envelope. Two Pacific Dogwood trees would be planted as replacement trees. Ten additional new trees are proposed with this application on the subject site. One mature Western hemlock (42cm DBH) at the front of the property is to be retained.

Six trees were inventoried on the neighbouring property boundary to the east, consisting of five English elms and one cherry. None of these trees are bylaw-protected. The arborist report (attached) confirms that they would not be impacted by the new parking lot construction. One large elm stump straddling the north property boundary would also be removed.

CONCLUSIONS

The proposal is consistent with the OCP as it relates to low-rise, multi-unit development within Urban Residential areas, and furthers the OCP and Humboldt Precinct Plan goals with regards to the conservation of heritage buildings. Staff recommend for Council's consideration that the application be advanced to a Public Hearing.

ALTERNATE MOTION

That Council decline Rezoning Application No. 00648 for the property located at 902, 906 and 910 McClure Street.

Respectfully submitted,

Álec Jóhnston Senior Planner Development Services Division

negh Ander Huste

Andrea Hudson, Acting Director Sustainable Planning and Community Development Department

Report accepted and recommended by the City Manager

beelyn Jenhaf N May 17, 2019 Date:

List of Attachments

- Attachment A: Subject Map
- Attachment B: Aerial Map
- Attachment C: Plans date stamped March 5, 2019
- Attachment D: Letter from applicant to Mayor and Council dated May 10, 2018
- Attachment E: Community Association Land Use Committee Comments dated April 12, 2018
- Attachment F: Arborist report dated August 9, 2018
- Attachment G: Advisory Design Panel minutes dated December 19, 2018
- Attachment H: Tenant assistance plan dated May 3, 2019.



Committee of the Whole Report For the Meeting of June 6, 2019

То:	Committee of the Whole	Date:	May 9, 2019
From:	Andrea Hudson, Acting Director, Susta	ainable Planning and	Community Development
Subject:	Development Permit with Variance A	Application No. 000	530 for 902, 906 and 910

RECOMMENDATION

That Council, after giving notice and allowing an opportunity for public comment at a meeting of Council, and after the Public Hearing for Rezoning Application No. 00648, if it is approved, consider the following motion:

"That Council authorize the issuance of Development Permit with Variance Application No. 000530 for 902, 906 and 910 McClure Street, in accordance with:

- 1. Plans date stamped March 5, 2019.
- 2. Development meeting all *Zoning Regulation Bylaw* requirements, except for the following variance:
 - i. reduce the minimum landscape strip for a surface parking lot from 1.0m to 0.67m.
- 3. The Development Permit lapsing two years from the date of this resolution."

LEGISLATIVE AUTHORITY

In accordance with Section 489 of the *Local Government Act*, Council may issue a Development Permit in accordance with the applicable guidelines specified in the *Official Community Plan*. A Development Permit may vary or supplement the *Zoning Regulation Bylaw* but may not vary the use or density of the land from that specified in the Bylaw.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to present Council with information, analysis and recommendations for a Development Permit with Variance Application for the property located at 902, 906 and 910 McClure Street. The proposal is to construct a four-storey hotel building while retaining the two existing hotel buildings. The variance is related to reducing the landscape screening requirements for the surface parking areas from 1.0m to 0.67m.

The following points were considered in assessing this application:

 the proposed development is generally consistent with the Design Guidelines for Development Permit Area 16: General Form and Character

- the proposal is consistent with the *Humboldt Valley Precinct Plan*, which encourages new development that compliments the scale, height and character of existing buildings in the area
- the properties at 902 and 906 McClure Street remain relatively unchanged with this proposal, other than minor landscaping changes and a covered walkway/ramp structure between the building at 906 McClure Street and the new building at 910 McClure Street
- the variance to reduce the landscape screening requirement is considered supportable as the parking area is screened from view by new fencing and plantings and by an adjacent carport.

BACKGROUND

Description of Proposal

The proposal is to retain the two existing hotel buildings (Abigail's Hotel) located at 902 and 906 McClure Street and construct a four-storey building with additional guestrooms and a meal room for guests at 910 McClure Street. In addition, the applicant is proposing heritage designation of the building located at 906 McClure Street. Specific details include:

- design of the four-storey building is intended to complement the Arts & Crafts Tudor Revival-style stucco and half-timbered design of the registered heritage building
- exterior materials of the new building include stucco siding, stone siding, painted wood trim, painted wood doors, and steel and glass guardrail
- a covered walkway connecting the heritage building to the new guest house with a steel and glass canopy
- retention and extension of the low rock wall at the front of the property
- reconfiguration of the rear yard parking and an increase in parking supply from 16 to 17 stalls plus four small car stalls
- addition of pedestrian lighting to the surface parking area
- removal of two driveway crossings on McClure Street
- front yard patio space with access via the ground level meal room
- removal of four trees and the addition of 13 new trees on-site.

The proposed variance is related to reducing the landscape screening for surface parking stalls from 1.0m to 0.67m.

Sustainability Features

As indicated in the applicant's letter dated May 10, 2018, the following sustainability features are associated with this proposal:

- one electric vehicle parking stall and charging station
- use of permeable surfaces for open site space and new parking stalls
- preservation of most significant trees and addition of eight new trees
- planting of native and adaptive species
- LED exterior light fixtures.

Advisory Design Panel

The application was referred to the Advisory Design Panel (ADP) on December 19, 2018. The ADP was asked to comment on the overall building and landscape design with particular attention to the landscape design in relation to the new parking area.

The ADP meeting minutes are attached for reference, and the following motion was carried:

"It was moved...that the Development Permit Application No. 000530 for 902, 906 and 910 McClure Street be approved subject to the following recommendations:

- shift the proposed building at 910 McClure Street marginally to the south to facilitate a reconfiguration of the rear parking area
- reconsider the proposed additional parking for ease of use, access, and proximity to the new building, with consideration to the provision of more permeable paving
- consider a more distinctly contemporary approach to the architecture of the new building, with special consideration to the massing of the fourth floor roof dormer."

In response to the ADP motion, the applicant has made changes to the pitch of the fourth floor dormer roof to improve the fit with the existing context. The architectural approach has not changed as the proposed building is intended to compliment the character of the heritage building, which is also an important part of the Abigail's Hotel identity. Staff are supportive of the decision to not shift the new building to the south, as doing so would reduce the pedestrian sight lines of the heritage building from McClure Street.

ANALYSIS

Development Permit Area and Design Guidelines

The Official Community Plan (OCP, 2012) identifies the site in Development Permit Area (DPA) 16: General Form and Character. The objectives of this DPA are to integrate new buildings in a manner that compliments and enhances the established place character of an area through high-quality architecture, landscape and urban design. Other objectives include providing sensitive transitions to adjacent properties with built form that is often three-storeys or lower, and to achieve more livable environments through considerations for human-scaled design, quality of open spaces, privacy impacts and safety and accessibility. The proposal is consistent with these objectives.

Design Guidelines that apply to DPA 16 are the *Multi-Unit Residential, Commercial and Industrial Design Guidelines* (2012), *Advisory Design Guidelines for Buildings, Signs and Awnings* (2006), and *Guidelines for Fences, Gates and Shutters* (2010). Staff consider that the proposal is generally consistent with the above Design Guidelines.

The *Multi-Unit Residential, Commercial and Industrial Design Guidelines* encourage the use of landscape elements to screen and enhance the look of rear yard surface parking. The *Zoning Regulation Bylaw* also requires a minimum 1m landscape buffer for surface parking. The applicant is proposing six new parking stalls, surrounded by landscaping, located at the rear of the new building with a 0.67m landscape strip along the north property line. The landscape strip would be planted with a mix of small shrubs. In addition, a new 1.8m wood fence would be constructed along the rear property line and a replacement Dogwood tree planted in the north-east corner of the site. These measures would help to screen the parking area for adjacent residential buildings; therefore, staff consider the landscape screening variance is supportable.

Local Area Plans

The *Humboldt Valley Precinct Plan* policies encourage new buildings to respect the character of adjacent heritage buildings without mimicry or replication. The overall height and siting of the new building (910 McClure Street) is sympathetic to the registered heritage building (906 McClure Street) and provides an appropriate transition to neighbouring properties. In addition, the form, character and materials of the new building compliment the heritage building and build

upon the character of the area. Furthermore, the articulation of the front façade, location of entrances and enhanced landscaping, along with the retained trees and historic rock walls, contribute to an attractive streetscape.

CONCLUSIONS

The proposed development is generally consistent with the applicable Design Guidelines and includes high-quality building materials and landscape finishes. The site planning and building design is supportable and complementary to the existing character of the area. The requested variance on landscape screening is considered supportable as it would have minor visual impact on adjacent properties. Therefore, staff recommend that Council consider advancing the application to an Opportunity for Public Comment.

ALTERNATE MOTION

That Council decline Development Permit with Variance Application No. 000530 for the properties located at 902, 906 and 910 McClure Street.

Respectfully submitted,

a.meyle

Alec Johnston Senior Planner Development Services Division

Report accepted and recommended by the City Manager:

Andrea Hudson, Acting Director Sustainable Planning and Community Development Department

celup Jenhujn

Date:

List of Attachments

- Attachment A: Subject Map
- Attachment B: Aerial Map
- Attachment C: Plans date stamped March 5, 2019
- Attachment D: Letter from applicant to Mayor and Council dated May 10, 2018
- Attachment E: Community Association Land Use Committee Comments dated April 12, 2018
- Attachment F: Arborist report dated August 9, 2018
- Attachment G: Advisory Design Panel minutes dated December 19, 2018
- Attachment H: Tenant assistance plan dated May 3, 2019.





902, 906 & 910 McClure Street Rezoning No.00648







902, 906 & 910 McClure Street Rezoning No.00648



ATTACHMENT C



















0 0 0 0 0 Ð 0 MATTERN ATT. Successive constraint
 minimize some constraint 100FAR 1/2/5.4 1204005-TV 32-0m 10PCC IV Date 1775 FOL-THE DORFE TO ANNEXCOURSE ASA. F IFFICIONIE F //Gim PROFESSION æ PERMIT POPPEN FONDRUCS IF ATTACORS an nucrose sea or Low trains F 42 4 COLUMNE -----DATELIOSHIE 12 DOM South Cross Section West Cross Section 1 Invue numberTEN number ~ ------74/V(T) - 12179 - 121 - 145 CLAPS SUMP 100 MSA MESA LED UNOP GAUR PÉ ATH MIS LINDY 14 Liphostafia Bade Bane 120 Bettone Met Liphonung - JANG - JANG - JANG Patio Enclosure Wall Elevation Brakke Skale Skale Skale Skale Skale Skale Skale Harrants . 110.016 ACTION ACTION 1040.4 1793 - 64 2019-03-05 N/A VIA +25. #_1/2# Abigail's Hotel INCOMPTO CO DURINO 8.817 MET HATA AT AT AN POSTSIVEN IA 902, 906, 910 McClure Street 10,000 10,700 11,700 T. #1 Proposed Cross Sections ----and Details F.T.N 1 Taxanter. Covered Walkway Elevation Perimeter Fence Elevation Proposed Light Standard Details SP BC -XXXXXX A-09 2016571 -





5P

XXXXXX

2016571

BC

A-11









ATTACHMENT D

May 10th, 2018

Mayor Lisa Helps & Council City of Victoria 1 Centennial Square Victoria BC V8W 1P6

RE: 902, 906, 910 McClure Street Rezoning and Development Permit Application

Dear Mayor Helps and Council,

NumberTEN Architectural Group on behalf of Abigail's Hotel, is pleased to submit this application to rezone the properties at 902, 906, and 910 McClure Street, and to develop on the land at 910 McClure Street.

THE PROPOSAL

This application proposes rezoning 902 and 906 McClure Street from their current T-7 'Bessborough Transient Accommodation District' zone and 910 McClure Street from its current R-K 'Medium Density Attached Dwelling District' zone to a new site-specific zone that will accommodate the two existing hotel buildings and a new purpose built building with 8 additional guestrooms.

The new building will facilitate in increasing the existing number of guestrooms from 23 to 31, as well as increasing the existing parking count from 16 to 21. The addition will also provide a much needed new and large breakfast room for the Hotel. The addition will contain an accessible elevator and a new ramp linking the existing and new building, allowing the hotel to now accommodate guests requiring accessible features.

BACKGROUND & NEED

Abigail's is a 'boutique' bed and breakfast hotel in the Fairfield-Gonzales area of Victoria. It is currently an intimate 23-room property that is housed in a 1930's heritage Tudor mansion.

Originally built in the 1930's as a Tudor revival-style apartment building, Abigail's Hotel was previously known as "The Bessborough" apartments located at 906 McClure Street. The apartments were named after Vere Brabazon Ponsonby, ninth Earl of Bessborough, who was Governor General of Canada from 1931 until 1935. The building is derived from the half-timbered houses of the 16th and 17th centuries with irregular shapes, steeply pitched roofs, multi-paned windows and rough-hewn materials. The Bessborough was originally an eight-suite luxury apartment building.

In 1985 The Bessborough was completely renovated, converting it into a seventeen room bed and breakfast inn. The exterior had been restored to its original Tudor architecture and it was designated as a Heritage Building in the Historic Registry of the City of Victoria.

In 1998 the "Coach House" located at 902 McClure Street, was constructed alongside the main house with six luxury guestrooms.

Number **TEN** Architectural Group

Partners

Barry R. Cosgrave Architect Inc.

Gregory E. Hasiuk Architect Inc.

Barrie J. Ottenbreit Architect Inc.

Doug Hanna Architect Inc.

Dave Lalama Architect Inc.

Senior Advisors

Robert A. Eastwood, FRAIC MAA, Architect AIBC (Retired)

Terry Cristall, FRAIC MAA (Retired) Architect AIBC (Retired)

Victoria Office:

200 -1619 Store Street Victoria, BC Canada V8W 3K3 250 360.2106 f 250 360.2166 victoria@numberten.com

Winnipeg Office: 310 – 115 Bannatyne Avenue Winnipeg, MB Canada R3B 0R3 204 942.0981 f 204 947.9626 winnipeg@numberten.com







Abigail's Hotel Letter to Mayor and Council May 2018

Page 2 of 10

Abigail's Hotel also owns the property at 910 McClure Street, which neighbours the Heritage portion of the hotel at 906 McClure Street. It is currently zoned to R-K which allows for mostly single or two family homes, hospitals and nursing homes. There is an existing two storey house on the site, which is partially leased to a tenant and partially used by Abigail's Hotel as storage.

Abigail's Hotel is a thriving business which offers a unique and stunning experience to its guests, doing so for decades. It has been the recipient of numerous accolades and awards, namely being the #1 hotel in Victoria for 8 years running, in the top 3 Best Small Hotels in Canada, top 3 for Best Service in Canada and #1 most Romantic Hotel in Canada as rated by guests. Furthermore, it is also ranked in the top 10 five star hotels in Canada by Trivago, and in the top 3 for Booking.com.

It is no secret that Victoria is a city that hosts increasing numbers of visitors and tourists yearly. It is essential to provide a variety of accommodation types so its visitors can enjoy their stay at high quality establishments to their tastes and likes. Tourism Victoria noted in its 'Tourism Victoria 2017 Annual Report' that the occupancy of Victoria's Transient Accommodation is on the rise. In 2012, the occupancy rate sat at 62.1%, by 2015 it had risen to 70.2%, in 2016 it rose to 74.2% and in 2017 it reached 73.4%, with almost 2 million passengers arriving at YYJ airport in 2017.

Abigail's has and wishes to continue providing one of the best guest experiences in Victoria. Abigail's is responding to the growing demand by proposing to expand its current operations whilst simultaneously bettering the experience of its guests in adding features that will broaden capabilities and capacity.

THE SITE

Located in a mixed residential neighbourhood, 902-910 McClure Street are very close to the Downtown, with convenient transit and walking access to many commercial, recreation and wellness services. Situated on the downtown periphery, the properties are ideally suited for purpose built, transient accommodation. The general site conditions are as follows:

ITEM	DESCRIPTION
SITE SIZE	• 902 McCLURE STREET - 352.25 sq.m (3,791.6 sf)
	 906 McCLURE STREET - 1,222.66 sq.m (6,482.7 sf)
	• 910 McCLURE STREET - 602.26 sq.m (6,482.7 sf)
SITE TOPOGRAPHY	Slopes from the North towards the South, where the property line meets McClure Street.
	• 4.46m (14.6ft) elevation difference from the highest point to the lowest point.



Abigail's Hotel Letter to Mayor and Council May 2018

Page 3 of 10

DESCRIPTION
 Contains one 2 storey residential building with a single storey portion on the ground level. There is a major holly tree in front of the building. Due to the steep nature of the site there is a small concrete retaining wall at street level. There are two large tree stumps at the rear of the site. There are several smaller trees at the front of the site.
 North - multi family residential apartments, Anglican Church, children's play park, Court House. South - single family residential homes, multi-family residential apartments, Beacon hill Park. East - single family residential homes, multi-family residential apartments West - multi family residential apartments, Downtown Core
 McClure Street ends in a turn around at the front of the sites. It is accessed via Vancouver Street from the east and abuts Quadra Street from the West. The west part of the site fronts Quadra Street. McClure Street is the major street for all of the sites.

LAND USE POLICY

We have ensured that the proposed building on 910 McClure Street meets many policy objectives of the City's Official Community Plan, and the Draft Fairfield Neighbourhood Plan.

Official Community Plan (OCP)

URBAN PLACE DESIGNATION - Urban Residential

BUILT FORM - Attached and detached buildings up to three storeys

PLACE CHARACTER FEATURES -

• Variable yard setbacks with primary doorways facing the street. Variable front yard landscaping, boulevard and street tree planting.

• On-street parking and collective driveway access to rear yard or underground parking.

USES -

Ground oriented multi-unit residential. House conversions.

• Low to mid-rise multi-unit residential.

• Low to mid-rise mixed-use residential along arterial and secondary arterial roads.

· Home occupations.

• Visitor accommodation along Gorge Road and pre-existing locations.

DENSITY -

Total floor space ratios generally up to 1.2:1



Abigail's Hotel Letter to Mayor and Council May 2018

Page 4 of 10

Policy 6.23

Generally support new development in areas designated Urban Residential that seeks densities toward the upper end of the range identified in Figure 8 where the proposal significantly advances the objectives in this plan and is:

• 6.23.1 within 200 metres of the Urban Core; or

6.23.2 within 200 metres of Town Centres or Large Urban Villages; or

• 6.23.3 along arterial or secondary arterial roads.

BUILDINGS AND SITES -

• 8.43 Encourage high quality architecture, landscape and urban design to enhance the visual identity and appearance of the City.

• 8.44 Support new infill and building additions that respond to context through sensitive and innovative design.

• 8.45 Encourage human scale in all building designs, including low, mid-rise and tall buildings, through consideration of form, proportion, pattern, detailing and texture, particularly at street level.

• 8.47 Encourage buildings adjacent to sidewalks and public plazas to maximize shop windows and entrances at ground level to support active land uses and provide interest for pedestrians throughout the Urban Core, Town Centres, and Urban Villages.

 8.48 Integrate off-street vehicle parking in a way that does not dominate development or streetscapes.

• 8.49 Continue to support new additions that conserve and enhance heritage property, as consistent with the National Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada.

• 8.50 Encourage new development to avoid the demolition of heritage property, or one or more of its facades.

HERITAGE CONSERVATION

8.51 Continue to give consideration to tools available under legislation to protect or conserve heritage property including, but not limited to: heritage designation bylaws; listing on the heritage register; temporary protection; heritage alteration permits; heritage revitalization agreements; design guidelines; and, the protection of views of heritage landmark buildings from public vantage points as identified in Map 8, and to be determined in future local area plans.
8.52 Continue to enable and support heritage conservation through incentives and allowances including, but not limited to: property tax reductions; grants; bonus density provision; and, zoning variances.

• 8.53 Require a heritage conservation plan, as appropriate, and heritage impact assessment, where relevant, for heritage alteration permits, heritage revitalization agreements, and rezonings for heritage properties.

• 8.54 Continue to work with senior government, community and business partners to identify, protect and conserve property of heritage value.

• 8.55 Continue to produce and update, as required, statements of significance for all property on the heritage register.


May 2018

Page 5 of 10

TOURISM AND VISITOR SERVICES

• 14.30 Support the clustering of tourist and visitor services in the Inner Harbour and Urban Core by retaining and enhancing the mix of service, retail, offices, visitor accommodation and harbour transportation uses, and arts and cultural facilities.

• 14.31 Strengthen the appeal of Victoria to tourists and other visitors in ways that enhance the community including:

- 14.31.1 Accessible transportation to and within the City;
- 14.31.2 A high quality of amenities, services and events;
- 14.31.3 An attractive and vibrant waterfront; and,
- 14.31.4 Character areas in the Downtown and other neighbourhoods.

• 14.33 Continue to invest in the heritage character of the Downtown and other neighbourhoods through incentives for rehabilitation and seismic upgrades.

• 14.35 Work with regional, community and business partners to expand cycling and pedestrian pathways along high-demand routes to major destinations and increase the availability of bicycles for visitors.

• 14.36 Encourage the local tourism industry to position Victoria as a green and socially responsible visitor destination through the use of efficient, low emission fuels, carbon offsets, waste reduction, and similar initiatives.

Fairfield Gonzales Neighbourhood Plan

The draft Fairfield neighbourhood was released in November 2017. Its Plan Vision identifies Fairfield as 'an inclusive, welcoming, safe and resilient neighbourhood steeped in beauty, heritage, and nature, and filled with connected people, vibrant community places, and strong local businesses'. It is grounded in four core principles, one of which is 'Ensuring economic viability: Fairfield's economy is robust and diverse, and supports local-serving businesses.' 902 -910 McClure Street sit within the 'Northwest' area. This area identifies one of its main goals as being to 'Create opportunities for more people to live close to downtown, jobs, amenities and transit.'

6.1 Land Use and Urban Design

• 6.1.1. Consider the maximum building heights of 20m, with approximately 5-6 storeys.

• 6.1.4. Consider development up to the base density of 1.2 : 1

• 6.1.8. New buildings should consider use of building elements and building designs that complement the surrounding area.

• 6.1.9. New buildings should be designed to provide a sensitive transition in scale to adjacent, smaller development through consideration for massing and other design features. Strategies to achieve this may include but are not limited to setting upper storey back, varying roof lines, increasing setbacks and siting and scaling buildings to reduce shading, etc.

• 6.1.11. Ensure that new development integrates attractive landscaping and building features that create attractive walking environments along adjacent streets.



May 2018

Page 6 of 10

• 6.2.1. Maintain and enhance the existing urban tree canopy on all streets to support attractive streetscapes and walkable environments.

• Explore the potential to redesign and transform McClure Street and Collinson Street as peoplepriority 'Living Streets' that include green features.

HERITAGE:

Goals:

1. Conserve the historic character of significant buildings and streets.

2. Celebrate and interpret the heritage of the neighbourhood.

• 10.1.2. Work with community partners to identify and support strategies to build awareness and celebrate Fairfield's historic buildings, streets, landscapes and other special places, and ways to conserve them.

PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT

Over the last several months, Abigail's Hotel has made a concerted effort to engage with the surrounding neighbours and the City during the concept plan development process (see below). Written feedback received from these events is attached to this application.

November 15th, 2017	Meeting with City of Victoria Planner Alec Johnson and
	Senior Heritage Planner Merinda Conley
January 10 th 2018	Neighbourhood Open House Meeting at Abigail's Hotel
	(Neighbours along Burdett, McClure and Vancouver
	Street)
February 15th 2018	Meeting with Fairfield Gonzales Community
DC	Association Land Use Committee (CALUC)
March 14 th 2018	Meeting with concerned neighbour and property
	owner, Donna Rhodes of 905 Burdett Avenue
April 12 th 2018	Community Meeting with the CALUC and neighbours
	within a 100m radius of the site.

Since the original concept drawing process began in late 2017, the design has evolved significantly to address issues and requests expressed by the City and by neighbours throughout the various consultation activities.

While changes in the design development have been informed by all of this feedback, we have been most diligent in observing comments made by the residents of 905 Burdett Avenue (the building immediately north of the properties). Their comments have inspired changes regarding the exterior lighting treatment to the rear of the site, have inspired the delicate approach to building height and the placement of prominent guestroom windows away from the views of the residents.



May 2018

Page 7 of 10

Other significant changes resulting from the conversations with neighbours and the City include:

• Pulling the building massing towards the rear of the site to allow the existing heritage building to be seen easily from McClure Street. This was requested by the City of Victoria's Senior Heritage Planner.

• The inclusion of an electrical vehicle parking stall.

• Varying the exterior trim detailing of the proposed building to make it distinctive from the heritage building.

• Working to maximize parking on site to limit the potential for crowding McClure Street on street parking.

PLANNING & DESIGN PROCESS

Building Design

The existing site at 910 McClure Street is the only of the three Abigail's sites that will be developed.

• The site has a relatively challenging terrain that includes more than a storey slope from the north to south.

• The adjacent building on the east side is a 2 storey residential building that sits tight to the east property line. The adjacent building to the west is the Heritage Designated main Abigail's Hotel building. It sits approximately 2.5m from the west property line.

• By massing the building with 4 floors, 3 storeys and a lower basement floor allows for a smaller footprint on site.

• The sloping roof elements, the green trim and stucco siding help to draw consistency between the existing heritage, coach house building and the proposed building.

• Use of matching multi-paned windows to further resonate with the building's heritage neighbour.

• The lower floor consists of the much-needed breakfast room, kitchen, and storage. Floors 2 and 3 show 3 guestrooms each, and the 4th floor has 2 guestrooms.

• The elevator provides necessary access to the hotel for disabled guests. The rooms will emulate those in the main and coach house, with matching windows and lower sloped ceilings.

• The 4th floor is concealed within the sloped roof. The height of the peak of the sloped roof will not exceed the height of the existing Abigail's Hotel building, in order to preserve the neighbour views to the Olympic mountain range and the ocean.

Landscaping

Key elements of the landscape plan include:

• Preservation of prominent site trees along McClure Street, including two onsite trees and the existing boulevard tree.

• Installation of new planting to complement the existing planting along the existing Abigail's frontage.

· Introduction of 8 new deciduous trees on site.

Perimeter fencing.



May 2018

Page 8 of 10

• Planter boxes on the patio.

· Wall mounted lights with full cut-off to aid in reducing light pollution to neighbours.

· Permeable pavers for parking stalls.

- Electrical vehicle charging stall available.
- Enclosed outdoor patio with permeable pavers.
- An enclosed and screened garbage and recycling area.

Transportation & Parking

See below an analysis of the existing and proposed parking on site.

SITE .	REQ'D UNDER CURRENT ZONE + SCHEDULE C	EXISTING	PROPOSED		
902 MCClure Street	0.5 stalls per guest room unit # of units - 6 Stalls req'd - 3	3 stalls	3 existing stalls to remain		
906 McClure Street	0.7 stalls per guest room unit # of units - 17 Stalls req'd - 11.9 or 12 Per Schedule C for Transient Accommodation	13 stalls	12 existing stalls to remain		
910 McClure Street	No less than 1.5 stalls per unit under zone R-K	2 (under R-K)	N/A		
	0.7 stalls per guest room unit # of units - 8 Stalls req'd - 5.6 or 6 Per Schedule C for Transient Accommodation	N/A	6 stalls		
902, 906, 910 McClure Street	0.5 stalls per unit for Coach House (3) 0.7 stalls per unit for Main building for transient accommodation (12) 0.7 stalls per unit for Proposed building for transient accommodation (6)	N/A	21 stalls		

Note that the proposed parking exceeds the requirements for parking under the proposed draft Schedule C, which requires a minimum of 0.5 per transient accommodation unit.

Of the 21 stalls available on site, one stall is designated as an accessible unit, and one stall is designated as an electrical vehicle parking stall, both responding to the increasing demand.

Under Schedule C, there is a requirement of 1 bike rack per 15 rooms plus one additional bike rack. We are providing 2.6 stall bike racks, one covered and one exposed.

Abigail's Hotel are considering an initiative in the future where they would purchase bicycles that the guests staying at hotel could use to explore the City of Victoria and surrounding areas.

The sites are close in proximity to four bus stops, 2 on Richardson Street and 2 on Fairfield Street. The BC Transit routes served at these bus stops are routes 1 and 7. Each stop is approximately a 5-



May 2018

Page 9 of 10

minute walk from the sites. However due to their location, the sites are within great walking distance of the Downtown core, taking roughly 10 minutes to walk to the BC Ferries bus connection and Island Link buses, and 15 minutes to the Inner Harbour.

Neighbourhood Impacts

The siting and design of the building are specifically intended to minimize impacts on neighbours. Shadow studies demonstrate that with the proposed setbacks and careful siting there is minimal shadowing on neighbouring buildings for the majority of the year except at the winter solstice when the sun is at its lowest, and even then the shadowing is minimal.

We have carefully oriented the guestrooms to avoid overlook and ensure privacy for both guests and neighbours, with the main guestroom windows facing south, with minor bathroom or corridor windows facing east and west. The major windows that face north do not directly look onto any neighbouring building. The inclusion of 1.8m high fencing and tall planting help to create a visual buffer and screen the views to and from the site.

Access to the proposed building for guests will primarily be through the main hotel entrance, where guests will check and be directed to the new building via the walkway. There will be a secure gate and fencing around the outdoor patio to allow limited exterior access to the patio and breakfast room.

Green Building Features

Abigail's Hotel will meet the BC Energy Step Code, Step 1. In addition, Abigail's will be attempting where possible to implement many sustainable and green features. The key features will include:

• The sustainable and thoughtful demolition and disposal of the existing building at 910 McClure Street through a Construction Waste Management Plan.

• Creation of a cycling initiative for guests as well as ample bike storage facilities to encourage both staff and guests to travel to and from the hotel via bicycle.

- The project includes the minimum of on-site parking required.
- The use of permeable surfaces for open site space and parking stalls.
- The preservation of key site trees and the addition of 8 new site trees.
- The use of native and adaptive planting on site.
- · LED exterior lighting fixtures.

• The final determination for the heating system has not yet been confirmed, but energy efficiency is one of the main selection criteria.



May 2018

Page 10 of 10

Infrastructure

A site servicing plan has not yet been completed but it is the assumption that there will be no servicing issues anticipated with the proposed development as its size and needs are not excessive in comparison to the infrastructure currently available to the site.

IN CLOSING

The City of Victoria has long been growing in popularity both as a place to settle into a unique and fulfilling life, and as a place to visit, relax and enjoy as a tourist. Abigail's Hotel has the unique opportunity of facing a positive, growing tourism future whilst having the ability and desire to expand its operations. The rezoning and development of their properties at 902, 906 and 910 McClure Street will meet the demand for transient accommodation and aid in growing an established and reputable local business.

Should you require any further information, please do not hesitate to contact the undersigned (250 360 2106 ext 5211, <u>bcosqrave@numberten.com</u>). If any additional information is needed relating the hotel operations, please contact Allison Fairhurst, General Manager of Abigail's Hotel (250 388 5363 <u>allison@abigailshotel.com</u>).

Sincerely,

Barry Cosgrave, Architect AIBC, MRAIC, LEED AP

Attachs.

cc. ShuHua Pei, Steve Chang, Allison Fairhurst – of Abigail's Hotel

Community Meeting Feedback Form

Location of proposed development:

Abigail's Boutique Bed and Breakfast Hotel, 906 McClure St.

COMMUNITY MEETING DETAILS

<u>Date</u>: Thursday, April 12, 2018 at the Fairfield Gonzales Community Association Space, 1330 Fairfield Road

Meeting hosted by Fairfield Gonzales Community Association Land Use Committee (CALUC)

<u>Approximate total number of people in attendance</u>: Committee = 9; Presenters and staff and representative of the owners = approx. 7; one (1) member of the public.

<u>Meeting Chair</u>: Kevin Warren <u>Note Taker</u>: Alice J. Albert and David Barlow

PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT DETAILS

<u>Applicant represented by</u>: Carl Peterson and Barry Cosgrove from Number 10 Architects and Alison Fairhurst of Abigail's.

The applicant explained that the proposal is to change the zoning for the subject property from RK medium density to a T-7 zone as an intermediate step to consolidate the lot. The plan to combine this single lot with the adjacent Abigail's property to create a new "T Zone" (Transitory Accommodation) that will be assigned by the City taking into account the existing and additional legal non- conformities. Given this, there could be no discussion of any variances given that the standards for this new "T Zone" are unknown at the present.

Abigail's currently has 23 guest rooms; six of which are in an adjacent building. The plan is to tear down an existing house on an adjacent property (owned by the hotel proprietors) and build a stand alone building to accommodate an additional 8 units, house an elevator and have a fully serviced breakfast room on the main floor. In addition, there will be a pathway—partially covered—from the main building to the new build. There will be an outdoor patio space facing McClure Street. It is envisioned that the hotel can be marketed to a broader clientele.

The proposed building height is equal to the height of the current main building. This is higher than the height of the building that will be demolished to make way for the proposed new building.

The existing house currently has one renter and the rest of the building is storage quarters for the hotel. The renter has been kept aware of the status and will be helped to re-locate.

CALUC Chair or designate and date:_

<u>Community Questions and Answers</u>: primarily from the CALUC. The lone attendee did not raise any questions.

<u>Comments from the formal feedback at a previously held open house</u> (approx. 25 attended) included: will there be blasting? No: there will be digging below ground level due to the topography as the lot rises up to Burdett St. Blocking of views to apartment building behind on Burdett Street? Limited. What of the height? It will not be any higher than the current, main, building. Light that shines brightly at rear of hotel? A type of exterior light fixture will be installed that will project the light downwards and be motion sensitive. For security reasons, the parking lot &etc need to be lit. The shadow study shows that at 1500 during each season the impact of shadowing will affect the house beside the property—to the East on McClure Street (which is owned by Isherwood and is to be part of the Mount St. Angela development).

The roof is equal to the height of the original building with some differences to differentiate it from the original building. The City's heritage department requested that the view of the front of the house be maintained which meant pushing the new build further back from the street. The fact that it is a pitched roof was commended by some members of the Committee.

The proponent stated that all the concerns raised at the Open House were resolved through discussions.

<u>Parking</u>: There are currently 17 stalls for 23 rooms; 3 underground parking stalls for the Quadra Coach House (that has 6 units) and 11 surface parking stalls for main building (that has 17 units). Six surface parking stalls are being proposed for the new building (that has 8 units).

Landscaping: Permeable paving; landscaping on the north of the property line; shrubs in front of the new fence—a 6' wooden fence on E. side. Their desire is to keep as many trees as possible.

<u>Technical concerns raised</u>: Alex Johnson had been consulted: T7 parcel requires 920 sq metres. Lot for development is 602 sq m. FSR is 1.75 and proposal 'fits' once the FSR is figured into the equation. Height is 10.8 and below required 11'. Site coverage is 30% and this proposal 'fits.' Sq footage of new build will be 450.6 sq m. Lots will be consolidated before issuing a building permit. This proposal poses problems with our process with no defined Zoning request. "It is/will be assessed based on the overall proposal and 'we can not hang our hats on the current zoning'."

Comments (including positive, negative, and neutral):

One member of our CALUC expressed considerable concern over the fact that there is no defined zoning request. Our discussion 'should be about the consolidated lot.' This is not possible at this time.

Overall, there was positive feedback to development.



<u>Talbot Mackenzie & Associates</u> Consulting Arborists

910 McClure Street, Victoria

Construction Impact Assessment &

Tree Preservation Plan

PREPARED FOR:

Barry Cosgrave NumberTEN Architectural Group 200 – 1619 Store Street Victoria, BC V8W 3K3

PREPARED BY:

Talbot, Mackenzie & Associates Noah Borges – Consulting Arborist ISA Certified # PN-8409A

DATE OF ISSUANCE:

February 19, 2018

Box 48153 RPO - Uptown Victoria, BC V8Z 7H6 Ph: (250) 479-8733 Fax: (250) 479-7050 Email: tmtreehelp@gmail.com



Consulting Arborists

Jobsite Property:	910 McClure Street, Victoria
Date of Site Visit:	February 5, 2018
Site Conditions:	Residential lot. No construction activity present. Gradually increasing in elevation south to north.

Summary: The proposed construction will require the removal of a 100cm DBH Elm stump (bylaw protected), located in the backyard of the property and possibly under shared ownership with the north neighbour. We do not anticipate excavation for construction of the parking area will significantly impact the health of neighbouring trees NT6-NT11. Western Hemlock NT2 can be retained if our recommended mitigation measures are followed. Excavation within the tree's critical root zone should be performed under the supervision of the project arborist and the final grades of the surrounding landscape area should accommodate the preservation of critical roots.

Scope of Assignment: To inventory the existing by-law protected trees and any trees on neighbouring properties that could be potentially impacted by construction or that are within three meters of the property line. Review the proposal to demolish the existing building at 910 McClure St. and construct a new building as part of Abigail's Hotel. Comment on how construction activity may impact existing trees. Prepare a tree retention and construction damage mitigation plan for those trees deemed suitable to retain given the proposed impacts.

Methodology: We visually examined the trees on the property and prepared an inventory in the attached Tree Resource Spreadsheet. Information such as tree species, DBH (1.4m), crown spread, critical root zone (CRZ), health, structure, and relative tolerance to construction impacts were included in the inventory. The by-law protected trees with their identification numbers were labelled on the attached Site Plan. The conclusions reached were based on the information provided within the attached site plans from Number 10 Architectural Group and landscape plans from Keith N. Grant Landscape Architecture Ltd. dated February 9, 2018.

Summary of Tree Resource: Eleven trees were inventoried. There is only one by-law protected tree: an English elm stump (NT5).

Trees to be Removed:

- English Elm NT5 is located in the footprint of the proposed parking area.
- Western Hemlocks NT3 and NT4 are each within 2m of both the outdoor patio and external ramp to be located between the existing hotel and new building. A large number of structural roots are expected to be encountered during excavation, which we anticipate will result in

910 McClure Street - Tree Preservation Plan

significant health impacts. Hemlocks typically exhibit poor tolerance to root disturbance and we do not anticipate they will recover from the impacts of the proposed excavation.

Potential Impacts on Trees to be Retained and Mitigation Measures

• Western Hemlock NT2: It is our understanding that this tree is to be incorporated into landscape plans so that it may be retained. The retaining wall and driveway adjacent to the tree are to be removed and the grade on the subject property reduced to more closely match the existing grade to the west of the tree. Depending on the depth of the retaining wall, roots may extend underneath the wall and may be encountered before the desired grade is reached.

To mitigate impacts to the tree's roots, we recommend the project arborist supervise any excavation within the CRZ as well as the removal of the existing retaining wall and driveway. Final grades may have to be determined at the time of excavation to accommodate the preservation of the tree's critical roots if it is to be retained.

- Trees NT6-NT11: The critical root zones of these trees overlap with the footprint of the proposed parking lot, which is located approximately 1.5m west of the property line. Excavation to bearing soil will likely encounter roots from the trees, but we do not anticipate that their health or stability will be significantly impacted. Elms NT7-NT11 may not have been planted but developed as root suckers of the Elm stump on the subject property (NT5). The neighbour should be notified of any potential impacts to their trees.
- Service Connections: It is our understanding that water, storm, and sewer connections are to be installed near the east property boundary. If any excavation for servicing is to be conducted within the critical root zone of municipal Mountain Ash NT1 an arborist should be on site to supervise and prune roots to the edge of excavation where appropriate. Depending on the proximity to the base of the tree, alternative excavation methods may be recommended (e.g. hydro-vac or air spade).
- **Barrier fencing:** The areas surrounding the trees to be retained should be isolated from the construction activity by erecting protective barrier fencing. Where possible, the fencing should be erected at the perimeter of the critical root zones. The barrier fencing must be a minimum of 4 feet in height, of solid frame construction that is attached to wooden or metal posts. A solid board or rail must run between the posts at the top and the bottom of the fencing. This solid frame can then be covered with plywood, or flexible snow fencing. The fencing must be erected prior to the start of any construction activity on site (i.e. demolition, excavation, construction), and remain in place through completion of the project. Signs should be posted around the protection zone to declare it off limits to all construction related activity. The project arborist must be consulted before this fencing is removed or moved for any purpose.
- Arborist Supervision: All excavation occurring within the critical root zones of protected trees should be completed under supervision by the project arborist. Any roots encountered must be pruned back to sound tissue to reduce wound surface area and encourage rapid compartmentalization of the wound. In particular, the following activities should be completed under the direction of the project arborist:

910 McClure Street – Tree Preservation Plan

- Any excavation for service connections that occurs within the critical root zones of trees to be retained (e.g. Mountain Ash NT1)
- Any excavation within the critical root zone of Hemlock NT2, as well as removal of the existing retaining wall and asphalt driveway slab
- Methods to avoid soil compaction: In areas where construction traffic must encroach into the critical root zones of trees to be retained, efforts must be made to reduce soil compaction where possible by displacing the weight of machinery and foot traffic. This can be achieved by one of the following methods:
 - Installing a layer of hog fuel or coarse wood chips at least 20 cm in depth and maintaining it in good condition until construction is complete.
 - Placing medium weight geotextile cloth over the area to be used and installing a layer of crushed rock to a depth of 15 cm over top.
 - Placing two layers of 19mm plywood.
 - Placing steel plates.
- **Demolition of the existing building:** The demolition of the existing house and any services that must be removed or abandoned, must take the critical root zone of the trees to be retained into account. If any excavation or machine access is required within the critical root zones of trees to be retained, it must be completed under the supervision and direction of the project arborist. If temporarily removed for demolition, barrier fencing must be erected immediately after the supervised demolition.
- **Mulching:** Mulching is an important proactive step to maintaining the health of the trees to be retained and mitigating construction related impacts and overall stress. Mulch should be made from a natural material such as wood chips or bark pieces and be 5-8cm deep. As much of the area within two times the dripline of the tree should be mulched, both inside and outside of the critical root zone. No mulch should be touching the trunk of the tree. See "methods to avoid soil compaction" if the area is to have heavy traffic.
- Irrigation Systems: The installation of any in-ground irrigation system must take into account the critical root zones of the trees to be retained. Prior to installation, we recommend the irrigation technician consult with the project arborist about the most suitable locations for the irrigation lines and how best to mitigate the impacts on the trees to be retained. This may require the project arborist supervise the excavations associated with installing the irrigation system. Excessive frequent irrigation and irrigation which wets the trunks of trees can have a detrimental impact on tree health and can lead to root and trunk decay.
- Arborist Role: It is the responsibility of the client or his/her representative to contact the project arborist for the purpose of:
 - o Locating the barrier fencing
 - o Reviewing the report with the project foreman or site supervisor
 - o Locating work zones, where required
 - Supervising any excavation within the critical root zones of trees to be retained

910 McClure Street - Tree Preservation Plan

Page 3 of 4

- o Reviewing and advising of any pruning requirements for machine clearances
- **Review and site meeting**: Once the project receives approval, it is important that the project arborist meet with the principals involved in the project to review the information contained herein. It is also important that the arborist meet with the site foreman or supervisor before any demolition, site clearing or other construction activity occurs.

Please do not hesitate to call us at (250) 479-8733 should you have any further questions. Thank you.

Yours truly, Talbot Mackenzie & Associates ISA Certified Consulting Arborists

Encl. 1-page tree resource spreadsheet, 1-page site survey with trees, 1-page building plans, 1-page landscape plans, 1-page barrier fencing specifications

Disclosure Statement

Arborists are professionals who examine trees and use their training, knowledge and experience to recommend techniques and procedures that will improve their health and structure or to mitigate associated risks.

Trees are living organisms, whose health and structure change, and are influenced by age, continued growth, climate, weather conditions, and insect and disease pathogens. Indicators of structural weakness and disease are often hidden within the tree structure or beneath the ground. It is not possible for an Arborist to identify every flaw or condition that could result in failure or can he/she guarantee that the tree will remain healthy and free of risk.

Remedial care and mitigation measures recommended are based on the visible and detectable indicators present at the time of the examination and cannot be guaranteed to alleviate all symptoms or to mitigate all risk posed. February 5, 2018

910 McClure St Tree Resource

Tag	Common Name	Latin Name	DBH (cm)	CRZ (m)	Crown Spread (m)	Health	Structure	Relative Tolerance	Remarks and Recommendations	
NT1	Mountain Ash	Sorbus intermedia	30	4.5	6.0	Good	Good	Poor	Municipal	
NT2	Western Hemlock	Tsuga heterophylla	42	6,5	8.0	Fair	Fair	Poor	Shared, Minor dieback	
NT3	Western Hemlock	Tsuga heterophylla	37	5.5	8.0	Fair	Fair	Poor	Shared. Uplifting driveway. Dieback, Included codominant stem	
NT4	Western Hemlock	Tsuga heterophylla	,39	6.0	8.0	Fair	Fair	Poor	Shared, Dieback, Small trunk wound at 1m AGL	
NT5	English Elm	Ulmus minor	100	12.0	3.0	Fair	Poor	Moderate	Shared with neighbour. Shoots growing from old stump	
NT6	Cherry	Prunus spp.	~30, 20, 15	6.0	6.0	Good	Fair	Moderate	Neighbour's. 1.5m from fence. Overhangs 2m	
NT7	English Elm	Ulmus minor	~10	1.0	4.0	Good	Fair	Moderate	Neighbour's. Likely a root sucker of NT5. 0.5m from fence. Overhangs 2n	
NT8	English Elm	Ulmus minor	~7	1.0	3.0	Good	Fair	Moderate	Neighbour's. Likely a root sucker of NT5. Adjacent to fence. Leaning over subject property 3m	
NT9	English Elm	Ulmus minor	~6	0.5	2.0	Good	Fair	Moderate	Neighbour's. Likely a root sucker of NT5. 1m from fence	
NT10	English Elm	Ulmus minor	~10, 3, 3	1.5	4.0	Good	Fair/poor	Moderate	Neighbour's. Likely a root sucker of NT5. Adjacent to fence. Overhangs 3m	
NT11	English Elm	Ulmus minor	~7, 5, 3	1.5	3.0	Good	Fair/poor	Moderate	Neighbour's. Likely a root sucker of NT5, Adjacent to fence. Overhangs 2m	

Prepared by: Talbot Mackenzie & Associates ISA Certified, and Consulting Arborists Phone: (250) 479-8733 Fax: (250) 479-7050 email: Treehelp@telus.net





ABIGAIL'S HOTEL EXPANSION - CONTEXT PLAN



۲





TREE PROTECTION FENCING

NOTES:

- FENCE WILL BE CONTRUCTED USING 38 X 89 mm (2"X4") WOOD FRAME: TOP, BOTTOM AND POSTS. * USE ORANGE SNOW-FENCING MESH AND SECURE TO THE WOOD FRAME WITH "ZIP" TIES OR GALVANZIED STAPLES.
- 2. ATTACH A 500mm x 500mm SIGN WITH THE FOLLOWING WORDING: WARNING-HABITAT PROTECTION AREA. THIS SIGN MUST BE AFFIXED ON EVERY FENCE FACE OR AT LEAST EVERY 10 LINEAR METRES.
- * IN ROCKY AREAS, METAL POSTS (T-BAR OR REBAR) DRILLED INTO ROCK WILL BE ACCEPTED

Saanich		
DETAIL NAME:	TREE PROTECTION FENCING	DATE: March/08 DRAWN: DM APP'D. RR
	H:\shared\parks\Tree Protection Fencing.pdf	SCALE: N.T.S.

4.2 Development Permit Application No. 000530 for 902, 906 and 910 McClure Street

The City is considering a Rezoning and Development Permit to retain the two existing buildings (Abigail's Hotel) and construct a four-storey hotel building with additional guestrooms and a meal room for guests. Heritage Designation of the building at 906 McClure Street is also proposed.

Applicant meeting attendees:

BARRY COSGRAVE	NUMBER TEN ARCHITECTURAL GROUP
DANIEL SMITH	NUMBER TEN ARCHITECTURAL GROUP
CARL PETERSON	NUMBER TEN ARCHITECTURAL GROUP
KEITH GRANT	KEITH N. GRANT LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTURE LTD.

Miko Betanzo provided the Panel with a brief introduction of the Application and the areas that Council is seeking advice on, including the following:

the proposed landscaping elements.

Barry Cosgrave provided the Panel with a detailed presentation of the site and context of the proposal, and Keith Grant provided the Panel with details of the proposed landscape plan.

Questions of clarification were asked by the Panel on the following:

- will the lots be consolidated?
 - o yes
- will the proposed building be attached to the heritage building, or are they separate buildings?
 - there will be three distinct buildings, with a covered walkway connecting the new building to the heritage building
- are 16 parking stalls proposed?
 - o there are 16 existing stalls, and 21 are proposed altogether
 - o one existing stall is lost and six are added with the proposal
- is the parking shared between the buildings?
 - yes, this is one hotel with rooms among three buildings
- how many trees are being removed?
 - o four trees will be removed and 13 will be added
 - is it possible to retain the large elm tree in the rear of the lot?
 - this elm is not much more than a short stump with shoots, yet it is counted among the trees being removed
- is there a proposal for the adjacent property to the east?
 - yes, there is a large project proposed, which will consolidate properties to the east
- can the number of electric car charging spaces be increased in the future if necessary?
 - o yes, this could easily be done
- what is the design rationale for the contemporary-style railing around the new building's patio?
 - the railing provides screening and safety for the steep slope towards McClure Street
 - o the design can be revised

- what is the reason for the secure fencing and gate separating the proposed building's patio?
 - o this is for separation and security from the street
 - o the existing patios are less visible from the street and are not gated
- what is the rationale behind the contemporary detailing of the proposed building?
 - the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada frown upon the replication of heritage buildings
 - o the new building is distinct from and respectful to the heritage building
 - the building proposes the same materials, colours and roof form, but with simplified details
 - the proposed building initially included detailing which was closer to the heritage building, but this was changed as a result of comments from the Heritage Advisory Panel
 - the new building is not supposed look brand new; the heritage quality is part of Abigail's corporate identity
 - the proposal should look close to the original hotel while being easily distinguished as a separate project
- what is the age of the heritage building?
 - the main building was built in the 1930's and renovated in 1985, and the coach house was constructed in 1998.
 - o the applicants are in the process of designating the heritage building
- why is there a retaining wall around the two new parking stalls at the northeast?
 - there is a drop in grade of about a foot between the newly-consolidated northeastern corner of the property and the existing parking area
- what is proposed for the stormwater collected from the parking area?
 - o the new parking stalls will have permeable paving
 - the existing parking remains as-is, with the addition of one parking stall and additional planting
- how do cars access stalls 1 and 2 at the northeastern corner of the lot?
 - o there is a sloped drive aisle to the south of these spaces
- is the parking stall closest to the new building in front of any windows?
 o no, it is not
- was an alternate parking configuration considered, such as continuing the existing layout towards the northeast corner?
 - this option was considered, but one stall was lost by continuing the existing parking layout
- how important is the retention of one additional stall?
 - it is important to retain this stall for peak occupancy times, and because parking was one of the neighbourhood's few concerns
 - the proposed configuration has been reviewed at a Fairfield Land Use Committee meeting
- would it be possible to shift the proposed building a half meter to the south?
 this could easily be done
 - this could easily be done
- are the proposed stairs connecting to the new building covered?
 - yes, and the ramp is not covered
- why is the proposed building so far from McClure Street?
 - the building was initially proposed closer to McClure Street, where the patio now sits; however, City staff requested that the side view of the heritage building be maintained
 - o the applicants would be happy to move the proposed building southward

- what is the current use of the adjacent property to the north of the new parking area?
 - residential; there is a house there
 - for what adjacent use does the landscape buffer provide screening?
 - the adjacent property to the north of the new parking area will be part of the proposed 6-storey senior's facility
 - the landscape buffer and covered parking also respond to concerns from residents of the apartments on Burdett Avenue.

Panel members discussed:

- concern for the tight parking layout and the proximity of vehicles to the proposed building
- appreciation for the overall site plan
- opportunity to shift the proposed building southward by about 2ft. to resolve vehicle circulation and parking configuration
- opportunity to reconfigure the proposed parking layout by swapping the location of the accessible parking stall with stall 12
- appreciation for the proposed landscape buffer for the surface parking
- the need for ample landscaping around the proposed patio's railings
- the proposed building as being insufficiently distinct from the heritage building
- concern that the new building is a poor reproduction of the heritage building
- the need to re-examine the proposed building's expression so that it is subservient and clearly distinguishable as a complimentary, contemporary addition
- the proposed building's lack of contemporary materials or style
- the boxy massing of the fourth floor is not harmonized with the rest of the proposed building
- if the proposed building is intended as a simplification of the heritage building's design, opportunity to reduce the number of batons in the gable and refine the fenestration in the proposed building
- opportunity to more delicately reflect the design of the heritage building
- opportunity to improve how the proposed building meets the ground.

Motion:

It was moved by Justin Gammon, seconded by Jason Niles, that the Development Permit Application No. 000530 for 902, 906 and 910 McClure Street be approved subject to the following recommendations:

- shift the proposed building at 910 McClure Street marginally to the south to facilitate a reconfiguration of the rear parking area
- reconsider the proposed additional parking for ease of use, access, and proximity to the new building, with consideration to the provision of more permeable paving
- consider a more distinctly contemporary approach to the architecture of the new building, with special consideration to the massing of the fourth floor roof dormer.

Carried

<u>For</u>: Jesse Garlick (Chair); Elizabeth Balderston; Sorin Birliga; Justin Gammon; Jason Niles; Carl-Jan Rupp; Stefan Schulson

Opposed: Deborah Le Frank



Sustainable Planning and Community Development 1 Centenial Square Victoria, BC V8W 1P6

Tenant Assistance Plan

This form must be submitted with your rezoning or development application. For contact, please send questions to your development services planner.

SUMMARY: Instructions to a complete and successful tenant assistance plan are as follows:

STEP 1	EP 1 BACKGROUND: Understand your rights and responsibilities as a landlord. Please review the documents in the background section pertaining to relocate tenants and the City's rental replacement policies.							
	TENANT ASSISTANCE PLAN: Complete form including:							
STEP 2	a. Current site information							
	b. Draft tenant assistance plan							
	c. Tenant communication plan							
	d. Appendix A: Current occupant information and rent rolls (Confidential)							
	e. Appendix B: Correspondence with tenants (Confidential)							
STEP 3	SUBMIT: Save and return the completed form to staff for comment by email.							
STEP 4	FINALIZE: Complete and submit a Final Tenant Assistance Plan with consideration of staff comments on draft plan previously submitted.							

BACKGROUND: Rights and Responsibilities of Landlords and Tenants

The rights and responsibilities of landlords and tenants are regulated by the Province and is set out in the <u>Residential Tenancy Act</u>. Please refer to the <u>Tenant Assistance Policy</u> and information regarding rental housing policies available on the City of Victoria's <u>website</u> for more information regarding the City of Victoria's rental housing policies.

TENANT ASSISTANCE PLAN

A. CURRENT SITE INFORMATION

Site Address:	910 McClure St	
Owner Name:	Parissa Pei	
Company Name:	1032405 BC Litd, Inc No.BC1032405	
Tenant Relocation Coordinator (Name, Position, Organization):	Allison Fairhurst, General Manager, Abigail's hotel	10

CURRENT TOTAL RENTAL UNITS

Unit Type	Number of Units
Bachelor	1
1 BR	
2 BR	-
3BR	
3BR+	
Total	

1



Sustainable Planning and Community Development 1 Centenial Square Victoria, BC V8W 1P6

Tenant Assistance Plan

This form must be submitted with your rezoning or development application. For contact, please send questions to your development services planner.

B. TENANT ASSISTANCE PLAN

	Applicant					City Staff		Applicant (Final)
Tenant Assistance Plan Components	Draft Tenant Assistance Plan (to be completed by the applicant with rezoning application)		Did the applicant meet policy?		City Staff Comments (to be completed by staff during application review)		Final Tenant Assistance Plan (to be completed by the applicant followin staff review, addressing staff comments)	
	Date:	April 2, 2019			Date:	April 25,2019	Date:	May 3, 2019
Compensation by tenancy length:	4 months rent based on occupancy start in 2013		Me		Meets p	olicy requirements		s rent based on occupancy start in 2013 olicy requirements
Up to 5 years: 3 months' rent		Yes	~					
 5 to 9 years: 4 months' rent 10-19 years: 5 months' rent 20+ years: 6 months' rent 	2			No				
 Notification: A minimum of 4 months notice to end tenancy 	A minimum of 4 months notice to A minimum of 4 months notice t		Yes No		Meets p	olicy requirements	approved construct	update on Notification after rezoning d allowing the Owner to decide when tion may proceed. (6 months minimum). olicy requirements
Moving Expenses: • An insured moving company may be hired by the applicant, with all arrangements and costs covered • Fixed rates apply for: • \$500 - Bachelor and 1 BR • \$750 - 2+ BR	Planner	Owner will update City's Housing with moving details when decision ig forward with project occurs.	Yes No			confirm the moving expense rate or the tenant.	tenant	moving expense has been offered to the olicy Requirement.

*	Applicant		City Staff	Applicant (Final)		
Tenant Assistance Plan Components	Draft Tenant Assistance Plan (to be completed by the applicant with rezoning application)	Did the applicant meet policy?	City Staff Comments (to be completed by staff during application review)	Final Tenant Assistance Plan (to be completed by the applicant following staff review, addressing staff comments)		
	Date: April 2, 2019		Date: April 25, 2019	Date: May 3, 2019		
 Relocation Assistance: Tenant Relocation Coordinator provided Three options provided comparable in size, location and rent amount (min. of one option in same neighbourhood) 	On going discussions with tenant on relocation options. When rezoning approved, Owner will meet with	Yes ✓ No	A letter has been provided by the applicant that they will provide relocation assistance in finding appropriate housing. Please confirm whether tenant has indicated that they request relocation assistance.	The Tenant Relocation Coordinator has provided City Staff an email response from Tenant that they have reviewed and accepted relocation assistance. Meets Policy Requirement.		
 Right of First Refusal: Offer to return to the building, with rent rates discounted by 10% of starting rates 	The building is being demolished for Hotel Addition. No rental housing.	Yes	N/A under the Residential Tenancy Act for Right of First Refusal.	The building is being demolished for Hotel Addition. No rental housing. N/A		
 Vulnerable Tenants: Please identify additional assistance offered to vulnerable tenants. This may include: Long-term tenants who may be paying significantly below marketrent, and for whom entering the current market may present financial challenges Tenants with specific housing needs due to a disability Seniors, who may be long-term tenants and living on a fixed income Families with young children, who may have difficulty finding appropriate units 	Current tenant able bodied (lives in house by himself). He works in the construction industry. Not considered a Vulnerable Tenant.	Yes ✓ No □	Meets policy requirement. Please confirm that a copy of the this tenant assistance plan will be provided to tenant and have the opportunity to review and submit response.	The Tenant Relocation Coordinator has provided City Staff an email response from Tenant that the tenant has reviewed and accepted the Tenant Assistance Plan. Meets policy requirement.		
Other Comments:						

C. TENANT COMMUNICATION PLAN

A Tenant Communication Plan outlines how and when applicants intend to engage and notify tenants of input opportunities throughout the development application process. Please indicate:

	Applicant	City Staff	Applicant (Final)
Tenant Communication Plan Components	Draft Tenant Communication Plan (to be completed by the applicant with rezoning application)	City Staff Comments (to be completed by staff during application review)	Final Tenant Communication Plan (to be completed by the applicant following staff review, addressing staff comments)
How and when did you inform tenants of the rezoning or development application?	Before re-zoning signs were erected which were installed on July 9, 2018.	Meets policy requirement	Before re-zoning signs were erected which were installed on July 9, 2018. Meets policy requirement
	ā	1 A 6	
How will you be communicating to tenants throughout the rezoning or development application (including decisions made by Council)?	Directly either in person, in writing and/or by phone	Meets policy requirement	Directly either in person, in writing and/or by phone Meets policy requirement
What kind of resources will you be communicating to your tenants and how will you facilitate tenants in accessing these resources? (Please see the City's <u>website</u> for a list of resources)	As required by city guidelines	Meets policy requirement	As required by city guidelines Meets policy requirement
Have tenants had the opportunity to include their needs in the Tenant Assistance Plan (including the opportunity to self-identify vulnerabilities)?	NA - not considered a vulnerable tenant	Awaiting response from tenant.	The Tenant Relocation Coordinator has provided City Staff an email response from Tenant that the tenant has reviewed and accepted the Tenant Assistance Plan. Meets policy requirement
Are tenants satisfied with the considerations and compensation in this TAP? Why or why not?	Yes	Awaiting response from tenant.	The Tenant Relocation Coordinator has provided City Staff an email response from Tenant that the tenant has reviewed and is satisfied with the plan.
Other communications notes:		Please log all written communication with applicant and tenant as part of your communications plan.	From staff: Please log all written communication with applicant and tenant as part of your communications plan.

4

FINAL TAP Review - [For office use only]

Application received by Kai Okazaki			(City Staff) on May 3, 2019	(Date)
Did the applicant meet the final TAP policy?	Yes 🖌	No 🗌		

Staff comments on final plan:

The applicant has met the policy requirements for the Tenant Assistance Plan.

The Tenant Relocation Coordinator has provided documentations from the tenant that the tenant has reviewed, accepted and are satisfied with the Tenant Assistance Plan.



Committee of the Whole Report

For the Meeting of June 6, 2019

То:	Committee of the Whole	Date:	May 9, 2019
From:	Andrea Hudson, Acting Director, S	Sustainable Planning	and Community Development
Subject:	Heritage Designation Applicatio	n No. 00181 for 906	McClure Street

RECOMMENDATIONS

- 1. That Council instruct staff to prepare the necessary Heritage Designation Bylaw that would approve the designation of the heritage-registered property located at 906 McClure Street, pursuant to Section 611 of the *Local Government Act*, as a Municipal Heritage Site, and that first and second reading of the Heritage Designation Bylaw be considered by Council and a Public Hearing date be set.
- 2. That Council authorize the Mayor and City Clerk to execute documents necessary to discharge Covenant #88497 in the form satisfactory to the City Solicitor from the property's title once the Heritage Designation Bylaw is approved.

LEGISLATIVE AUTHORITY

In accordance with Section 611 of the *Local Government Act*, Council may designate real property, in whole or in part, as protected property.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to present Council with information, analysis and recommendations regarding an owner request to designate the exterior of the heritage-registered property located at 906 McClure Street.

The designation of this building is consistent with the *Official Community Plan* (OCP, 2012) and the *Victoria Heritage Thematic Framework*, and the Statement of Significance supports the designation.

The application was reviewed by the Heritage Advisory Panel at its December 12, 2018 meeting and was recommended for approval.

BACKGROUND

Description of Proposal

The property located at 906 McClure Street, also referred to as Abigail's Hotel, is a three-and-ahalf storey, symmetrically massed Tudor Revival apartment building built in 1930. The exterior façade of 906 McClure Street has maintained much of its original appearance. The property has historical and aesthetic worth as a good example of the Tudor Revival style built during the interwar period of Victoria's history, characterized by an eclectic mix of revival styles. The building is representative of Theme 5 - Cultural Exchange of the City's Heritage Thematic Framework, specifically 5.1 - Architectural Expression. Its character-defining elements include stucco and plank cladding representing the Tudor "half-timbered" building style; wood-frame, double-hung windows with a multi-lite upper sash; an elaborate, steep multi-gable roof and decorative chimneys; a projecting entrance highlighting the building's symmetry and a decorative gatehouse entry; and its location overlooking the Humboldt Valley with mature landscaping and a perimeter stone wall. The building is also valued for its association with the practice of notable architect Thomas Hooper and with its builder, Maude Mary Hutchinson.

The building also has cultural worth as an example of an apartment building designed to provide an alternative living arrangement for residents within a neighbourhood of mainly single family houses. The adaptive re-use of the building began in 1985 when the owner renovated it as a 17-room bed and breakfast inn. At the time, the building was subjected to a heritage conservation covenant, which the owner now wishes to replace with a heritage designation bylaw.

Zoning / Land Use

The proposed heritage designation is consistent with surrounding land uses.

Condition / Economic Viability

The building is in good physical condition and has been well maintained for its tourist customer base. The interior was altered from its original form in 1985; however, the exterior maintains its original appearance.

ANALYSIS

The following sections provide a summary of the application's consistency with the relevant City policies and guidelines.

Official Community Plan

The designation of this building is consistent with the *Official Community Plan* (OCP, 2012), which states in Section 8, "Placemaking (Urban Design and Heritage)":

Goals

8 (B) Victoria's cultural and natural heritage resources are protected and celebrated.

Broad Objectives

- 8 (j) That heritage property is conserved as resources with value for present and future generations.
- 8 (I) That heritage and cultural values are identified, celebrated, and retained through community engagement.

City Form

8.6 Conserve and enhance the heritage value, character and special features of areas, districts, streetscapes, cultural landscapes and individual properties throughout the city.

8.11 Determine the heritage value of areas, districts, streetscapes, cultural landscape and individual properties using the Victoria Heritage Thematic Framework as identified in Figure 12.

Buildings and Sites

- 8.51 Continue to give consideration to tools available under legislation to protect or conserve heritage property including, but not limited to: heritage designation bylaws; listing on the heritage register; temporary protection; heritage alteration permits; heritage revitalization agreements; design guidelines; and, the protection of views of heritage landmark buildings from public vantage points as identified in Map 8, and to be determined in future local area plans.
- 8.54 Continue to work with senior government, community and business partners to identify, protect and conserve property of heritage value.

The designation of this building is also consistent with Section 21, "Neighbourhood Directions (*Fairfield Strategic Directions*)" of the OCP, which states:

21.6.1 Maintain and enhance established character areas.

Victoria's Heritage Thematic Framework

A key policy of the OCP includes the determination of heritage value using a values-based approach. In this regard, a city-wide thematic framework (OCP, Fig. 12) was developed and incorporated into the OCP to identify the key civic historic themes. The *Victoria Heritage Thematic Framework* functions as a means to organize and define historical events, to identify representative historic places, and to place sites, persons and events in an overall context. The thematic framework recognizes a broad range of values under which city-wide themes can be articulated. A Heritage Value assessment with consideration of the *Victoria Heritage Thematic Framework* is incorporated into the Statement of Significance.

Statement of Significance

A Statement of Significance describing the historic place, its attributes and its history is attached to this report.

Heritage Advisory Panel

The application was reviewed by the Heritage Advisory Panel at its December 12, 2018 meeting, and it was recommended that Council consider approving the designation of the heritage-registered property located at 906 McClure Street.

CONCLUSIONS

This application for the designation of 906 McClure Street as a Municipal Heritage Site is for a building that is a surviving representative example of the Tudor Revival style, and was built by a financially independent woman to provide alternative residential accommodations in an area of mainly single detached houses. It has aesthetic, cultural and historical worth, which together give it heritage value. Staff therefore recommend that Council consider approving the Heritage Designation Application for the heritage-registered building located at 906 McClure Street.

ALTERNATE MOTION

That Council decline Heritage Designation Application No. 000181 for the property located at 906 McClure Street.

Respectfully submitted,

Merinda Conley Senior Heritage Planner Development Services Division

Megs Ahote

Andrea Hudson, Acting Director Sustainable Planning and Community Development Department

Report accepted and recommended by the City Manager(

Date:

List of Attachments

- Attachment 1: Subject Map
- Attachment 2: Aerial Map
- Attachment 3: Photographs
- Attachment 4: Statement of Significance
- Attachment 5: Letter from the applicant, dated October 15, 2018
- Attachment 6: Minutes of December 12, 2018 meeting of the Heritage Advisory Panel.







906 McClure Street Heritage Designation #000181

CITY OF VICTORIA

Designated

Registered

906 McCLURE STREET



South Façade - Archival



South Façade

906 McCLURE STREET



Northeast View



North Rear Façade

906 McCLURE STREET



Northwest View with 1998 Coach House

Address: 902-906 McClure Street

Description of historic place:

Abigail's Inn is a three-and-one-half storey Edwardian Tudor Revival stucco hotel located in the northwestern quadrant of Victoria's Fairfield neighbourhood.

Heritage value:

The historic place, built in 1930, is valued for its architecture, its architect, what its construction says about social values and female ownership in the 1930s, and how a change in use can preserve a landmark building.

Abigail's Inn has heritage value as an example of a Tudor Revival apartment block. This style, popular in Canada because of the political and cultural ties to Britain, is characterized by prominent half-timbering, a strong masonry foundation, and tall ornate chimneys. The half-timbering is derived from Elizabethan England where heavy timber structural frames were infilled with masonry panels. Among other hallmarks of the style are jettying (elements on the upper storeys projecting over lower levels), tall narrow windows in groups of three or more, and verticality.

Built as a rental property for Mrs. M. Hutchinson, it was originally called the Bessborough, named for Vere Brabazon Ponsonby, ninth Earl of Bessborough, governor general of Canada from 1931-1936. It represented the latest in luxury suites with dining rooms, dens, and fireplaces on a street of similar homes. There is value in the design by Percy Fox. Born in England, he came to Canada in 1911. He worked briefly in Thomas Hooper's office, then went into private practice. He worked in partnership with Ralph Berrill but returned to a sole practice in 1921. He designed in several styles including Craftsman, Tudor Revival, and English cottage.

The conversion of the building 1985 to a bed and breakfast establishment in 1985 is a good example in the City of adaptive re-use.

Character-defining elements:

The heritage character of Abigail's Hotel is defined by the following elements:

 - characteristics of the Tudor Revival style including stucco, half-timbering, double hung windows with upper portion latticed, some casement windows in upper storeys, steep gable roof with two gabled dormers in front, stone arched entranceway with balcony above, some corbelling under roof and balcony, tall chimneys

- monumentality

- mature landscaping and recent additions
- light fixtures in main entrance
- stone wall in front of property
- siting on a hill
October 15, 2018

Mayor & Council City of Victoria 1 Centennial Square Victoria BC V8W 1P6

re: 906 McClure Street Application for Heritage Designation

Dear Mayor and Council:

Number TEN Architectural Group, on behalf of the owners Abigail's Hotel, is pleased to submit this application for a Heritage Designation for the building at 906 McClure Street originally known as the Bessborough Apartments and currently the main building of Abigail's Bed and Breakfast Hotel operation. Originally built in the 1930's as a Tudor revival-style apartment building, it was completely renovated in 1985 converting it into a 17-room bed and breakfast inn. At that time, the building received a Heritage Conservation Covenant without a Heritage Designation Bylaw.

The hotel was expanded in 1998 with the Coach House, a stand-alone building fronting along Quadra Street with 6 guestrooms. The Owners are currently in for a rezoning and development permit application for the property at 910 McClure Street with a stand-alone building with 8 guestrooms.

The Owners take great care in the original building as Abigail's has won many prestigious awards including Trivago's Top Ten 5 Star Hotels in Canada Award for 2018, Hotels Combined 2018 Recognition of Excellence and Trip Advisor's Travellor's Choice Award for 2018.

The Owners ongoing intention is to ensure the long-term protection of the property and wish to replace the 1985 Heritage Conservation Covenant with a Heritage Designation Bylaw.

Should you require any further information, please contact the undersigned. If any additional information is required related to hotel operation, please contact Allison Fairhurst, general manager of Abigail's Hotel (T: 250 388-5363 E: allison@abigailshotel.com).

Sincerely,

Barry Cosgrave, Architect AIBC, MRAIC, LEEDap

c.c. ShuHua Pei, Steve Chang and Allison Fairhurst of Abigail's Hotel Merinda Conley, Senior Planner Heritage Alec Johnston, senior Planner Development Services

Number TEN Architectural Group

Partners

Barry R. Cosgrave Architect Inc.

Gregory E. Hasiuk Architect Inc.

Barrie J. Ottenbreit Architect Inc.

Doug Hanna Architect Inc.

Dave Lalama Architect Inc.

Senior Advisors

Robert A. Eastwood, FRAIC MAA, Architect AIBC (Retired)

Terry Cristall, FRAIC MAA (Retired) Architect AIBC (Retired)

Victoria Office:

200 -1619 Store Street Victoria, BC Canada V8W 3K3 250 360.2106 f 250 360.2166 victoria@numberten.com

Winnipeg Office:

310 – 115 Bannatyne Avenue Winnipeg, MB Canada R3B 0R3, 204 942.0981 f 204 947.9626 winnipeg@numberten.com





4. 906 McClure Street Heritage Designation Application No. 000181

Attendees: Daniel Smith, Carl Peterson and John Dam, Number 10 Architectural Group

Merinda Conley, Senior Heritage Planner, provided a brief summary of the application.

Panel Questions and Comments

- Appreciation for the fulsome approach to presenting heritage designation applications.
- Recognition of the hotel's importance to Victoria's tourism as well as its heritage. Heritage designation of the hotel may add economic value to the business.
- Are the same character-defining elements protected under the current heritage covenant and under the proposed heritage designation bylaw? Specifically, are the landscaping and perimeter stone wall part of the proposed designation? Merinda Conley: Through the rezoning application, the City has requested that the heritage covenant be replaced with a heritage designation bylaw. Character-defining elements, including the landscaping and stone wall, would be protected under the designation bylaw, but are not included under the current heritage covenant. A heritage designation bylaw would add clarity as to which portions of the property are designated, and would ensure that the building is not demolished.
- Heritage designation of the property is consistent with the heritage program and is
 preferred over the existing covenant.

Moved

Seconded

That the Heritage Advisory Panel recommend that Council approve the designation of the heritage-registered property located at 906 McClure Street, pursuant to Section 611 of the *Local Government Act*, as a Municipal Heritage Site.

Carried (unanimous)



























History

- 3.5-storey Tudor Revival style building designed by architect Percy Fox, and constructed in 1930, built by Maude Hutchinson as an income generating apartment building
- called Bessborough Apartments after the Ninth Earl of Bessborough, Governor General of Canada from 1931 to 1936
- renovated in 1985 as a 17-room bed & breakfast inn
- Abigail's Hotel has won multiple awards and is on Trivago's top ten 5-star hotels in Canada
- the property currently has a heritage conservation covenant registered on title.









Heritage Value

Aesthetic Value

• a unique example of the Tudor Revival style

Historical and Cultural Value

- association with Percy Fox and the practice of notable architect Thomas Hooper
- association with its builder, Maude Hutchinson
- an example of an apartment building designed to provide alternative living arrangements for residents within a neighbourhood of mainly SFDs.





Heritage Character

Character-Defining Elements

- placement on a rise giving the building monumentality
- · symmetrical massing
- Tudor Revival detailing
- · half-timbered stucco wall surfaces
- steep gabled roof with two frontfacing gabled dormers
- double-hung windows with multilite upper sashes
- tall ornate chimneys
- strong masonry foundation



Heritage Character

Character-Defining Elements

- projecting stone arched entranceway with a balcony above
- · multi-lite paneled doors
- · decorative brackets
- exposed rafters
- light fixtures









<section-header><section-header><section-header><text>



