



Committee of the Whole Report

For the Meeting of November 23, 2017

To: Committee of the Whole **Date:** November 7, 2017

From: Jonathan Tinney, Director, Sustainable Planning and Community Development

Subject: Heritage Alteration Permit Application No. 00224 for 700 Government Street

RECOMMENDATION

That Council authorize the issuance of the Heritage Alteration Permit Application No. 00224 for 700 Government Street in accordance with:

1. Plans, date stamped November 7, 2017.
2. Development meeting all *Zoning Regulation Bylaw* requirements.
3. Final plans to be generally in accordance with the plans identified above to the satisfaction of the Assistant Director, Development Services Division, Sustainable Planning and Community Development.
4. Heritage Alteration Permit lapsing two years from the date of this resolution.

LEGISLATIVE AUTHORITY

In accordance with Sections 617 and 618 of the *Local Government Act*, Council may issue a Heritage Alteration Permit which may be subject to terms consistent with the purpose of the heritage protection of the property, including: (i) conditions respecting the sequencing and timing of construction, (ii) conditions respecting the character of the alteration or action to be authorized, including landscaping and the siting, form, exterior design and finish of buildings and structures and (iii) security. Council may refuse to issue a Heritage Alteration Permit for an action that, in the opinion of Council, would not be consistent with the purpose of the heritage protection of the property.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to present Council with information, analysis and recommendations for a Heritage Alteration Permit Application for the property located at 700 Government Street. The proposal is to repair and replace paving material along the Lower Causeway apron as part of the Lower Causeway Minor Improvements Project.

The following points were considered in assessing this Application:

- consistency with the *Official Community Plan* (OCP) to conserve the heritage value, character, significance and historic context, in the enhancement of the Inner Harbour

- consistency with the relevant guidelines of DPA 9 (HC): Inner Harbour to conserve the heritage value, character and significance of this area
- consistency with the relevant policies in the *Downtown Core Area Plan* (DCAP) to ensure improvements are sensitively integrated into the historic environment
- consistency with the *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada* to conserve heritage value through protection, evaluation, maintenance and repair, and interventions that are compatible, subordinate, and distinguishable
- Statement of Significance to identify character-defining elements of the Lower Causeway.

The proposed temporary replacement of quartzite tiles along the Lower Causeway apron is consistent with relevant City policies and the *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada*. Staff recommend that Council authorize Heritage Alteration Permit No. 00224 for 700 Government Street.

BACKGROUND

Description of Proposal

The purpose of this report is to present Council with information, analysis and recommendations regarding a Heritage Alteration Permit Application for the property located at 700 Government Street.

On November 24, 2016, a Delegated Heritage Alteration Permit for the Lower Causeway Minor Improvements Project was approved for the repair and maintenance of the Lower Causeway that included pavement repairs and upgrades, refurbishment of mushroom lights, power washing existing concrete surfaces and resealing, causeway edge repair, bench replacement and directional lighting.

During the repairs it was determined by the applicant that the quartzite tile pavers along the causeway apron are in need of repair and upgrading. As described in the attached Summary of the History of Repairs to the Causeway Promenade (2010 to present), there have been continuous maintenance issues and safety hazards related to the lower deck pavement. The top concrete slab does not have adequate depth to protect reinforcing steel from exposure to chlorides. Due to this condition, topped with very thin 1/2" quartzite tiles, the rebar is popping up, the tile is cracking and deteriorating along the edges, and tripping and safety hazards are a concern.

Further assessments are being undertaken to determine the extent of future intervention. However, the rebar continues to deteriorate. The intent of this Application is to enable the repair and temporary replacement of the quartzite tile pavers with a thicker stamped concrete layer to protect the rebar from chlorides and stabilize the Lower Causeway apron until further intervention, as determined by the assessments, can occur. The original quartzite tiles are to be stored until their reinstallation is completed.

ANALYSIS

The following sections provide a summary of the Application's consistency with the relevant City policies, regulations and the *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada*.

Official Community Plan

The Application is consistent with the OCP and DPA 9 (HC) Inner Harbour because it contributes to the following objectives:

4. (a) *To conserve the heritage value, special character and the significant historic buildings, features and characteristics in the Inner Harbour area.*
4. (c) *To enhance the Inner Harbour through high quality architecture, landscape and urban design that reflects the area's functions as a marine entry, working harbour and community amenity in scale, massing and character while responding to its historic context including heritage landmark buildings.*

Development Permit Area (DPA 9 (HC): Inner Harbour)

The property is located within Development Permit Area 9 (HC), which is identified in the OCP and whose objectives include:

4. (b) *To conserve the heritage value, special character and the significant historic buildings, features and characteristics of this area.*

Downtown Core Area Plan

The Application is consistent with the objectives and policies of the DCAP in relation to Historic Context which states:

- 3.75 *Support the protection and rehabilitation of heritage properties and ensure new infill development and improvements to the public realm are sensitively integrated into the historic environment.*

Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada

The *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada* include the following standards applicable to this Application:

1. *Conserve the heritage value and character-defining elements when creating any new additions to an historic place or any related new construction. Make the new work physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to and distinguishable from the historic place.*

The proposed temporary replacement (until the quartzite tile is reinstalled) of the causeway apron tile has minimal impact on the heritage value of the Lower Causeway. The spatial relationship between the pedestrian zone, gathering areas, and contemplative areas is not impacted.

2. *Conserve changes to an historic place that, over time, have become character-defining elements in their own right.*

The causeway apron repair and replacement conserves changes to the Lower Causeway that have been undertaken over time.

3. *Conserve heritage value by adopting an approach calling for minimal intervention.*

Repair and temporary replacement of the causeway apron surface materials is undertaking minimal intervention to address tripping and safety hazards until further intervention is undertaken.

6. *Protect and, if necessary, stabilize an historic place until any subsequent intervention is undertaken.*

The proposed repair and temporary replacement of quartzite tile pavers stabilizes the Lower Causeway apron until further intervention can occur to address the structural integrity of the existing reinforcement. Original quartzite tile will be stored for reinstallation once deck conditions are addressed.

7. *Evaluate the existing condition of character-defining elements to determine the appropriate intervention needed. Use the gentlest means possible for any intervention. Respect heritage value when undertaking an intervention.*

Existing condition has been evaluated and the replacement of ½" quartzite tile pavers with a stamped concrete topping matching the pattern, colour, and texture of the existing tile is a minimal approach for replacement until subsequent intervention can occur and original quartzite tiles can be reinstalled.

8. *Maintain character-defining elements on an ongoing basis. Repair character-defining elements by reinforcing their materials using recognized conservation methods. Replace in kind any extensively deteriorated or missing parts of character-defining elements, where there are surviving prototypes.*

The condition of the top reinforcement in the existing slab is currently not conducive to the replacement using the current ½" thick quartzite tile with surviving tile from other areas as the top concrete layer is not deep enough to provide necessary protection for reinforcement.

9. *Make any intervention needed to preserve character-defining elements physically and visually compatible with the historic place and identifiable on close inspection.*

The temporary replacement material for the apron quartzite tile will show a variation in finish and patina, which compatibility allows as it serves as the distinguishing factor. Repair would be identifiable on close inspection; however, replacement with a stamped concrete of similar colour and texture will be more apparent.

10. *Repair rather than replace character-defining elements. Where character-defining elements are too severely deteriorated to repair, and where sufficient physical evidence exist, replace them with new elements that match the forms, materials and detailing of sound versions of the same elements.*

The temporary replacement material for the apron quartzite tile will closely match the texture, pattern and colour of the existing quartzite tile.

11. *Conserve the heritage value and character-defining elements when creating any new additions to an historic place or any related new construction. Make the new work physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to and distinguishable from the historic place.*

The proposed repair and replacement of the causeway apron does not radically change or have a negative impact on the character-defining elements, uses or spatial configurations, and is consistent with this guideline in the following ways:

- Compatible - use of similar but contemporary materials of a similar colour, texture, and pattern.
- Subordinate - the Lower Causeway will continue to be prominent.
- Distinguishable - replacement materials will be visually compatible and distinguishable and will not imitate, nor highly contrast with, the historic fabric of the Lower Causeway.

12. *Create any new additions or related new construction so that the essential form and integrity of an historic place will not be impaired if the new work is removed in the future.*

Temporary replacement material will enable the removal of such material to allow for interventions as identified by future assessment of the Lower Causeway.

Heritage Advisory Panel

The Application was reviewed and declined by the Heritage Advisory Panel at its September 12, 2017 meeting (minutes attached). Some concerns included the lack of information about the long-term plan, the lack of information about the proposed interim materials, and the proposed method of patching being the same as that used in June, which has since failed.

Other Considerations

Potential Safety Issue

Due to the tripping hazard caused by the lifting tiles, there is a degree of urgency to the proposal to undertake these interim repairs, as indicated in the applicant's letter dated November 7, 2017.

Failed Test Area

As per the applicant's letter dated November 7, 2017, the Greater Victoria Harbour Authority (GVHA) has made an effort to repair the adhesion of the tiles; however, these repairs were also temporary until GVHA could arrive at a longer-term temporary solution as outlined in this report and attached documents, which attributed to the failure of this patch.

CONCLUSIONS

The Lower Causeway apron tile along the seawall edge is in serious need of repair and upgrading. The existing reinforcement is corroding and being forced upward through a very thin concrete layer and is resulting in the thin ½" quartzite tile cracking and separating from the base. Safety measures have necessitated a temporary repair of the apron with a thicker stamped concrete layer that would be similar to the existing tile in texture, colour and pattern to protect the rebar from further exposure to chlorides while further assessments of the Lower Causeway deck are undertaken prior to further intervention.

ALTERNATE MOTIONS

That Council decline Heritage Alteration Permit Application No. 00224 for the property located at 700 Government Street.

Respectfully submitted,



Merinda Conley
Senior Heritage Planner
Development Services Division



Jonathan Tinney, Director
Sustainable Planning and Community
Development Department

Report accepted and recommended by the City Manager:



Date:

Nov 15, 2017

List of Attachments

- Attachment A - Subject map
- Attachment B - Aerial photograph
- Attachment C - Lower Causeway Improvements/Repair Project plans, date stamped November 7, 2017
- Attachment D - Letter from applicant, date stamped November 7, 2017
- Attachment E - Structural Engineer Recommendation letter, date stamped August 24, 2017
- Attachment F - Summary of the History of Repairs to the Causeway Promenade (2010 to present), date stamped August 24, 2017
- Attachment G - Statement of Significance
- Attachment H - Heritage Advisory Panel Meeting Minutes, September 12, 2017.