



## **Joint Advisory Design and Heritage Advisory Panel Report**

**For the Meeting of February 1, 2017**

---

**To:** Joint Advisory Design and Heritage Advisory Panel **Date:** January 19, 2017  
**From:** Charlotte Wain, Senior Planner - Urban Design  
Merinda Conley, Senior Heritage Planner  
**Subject:** Rezoning Application No. 00466 and Heritage Alteration Permit Application No. 00214 for 913-929 Burdett Avenue and 914-924 McClure Street

---

### **RECOMMENDATION**

That the Joint Advisory Design and Heritage Advisory Panel receive this report for information and provide a recommendation to Council.

### **COUNCIL DIRECTION**

At the Committee of the Whole (COTW) meeting of January 12, 2017, Committee approved the following motion:

"That a meeting of the Joint Heritage Advisory Panel and the Advisory Design Panel be convened to consider the application for 913-929 Burdett Avenue and 914-924 McClure Street and that the report from the joint panel be included in the agenda when the application is considered by the Committee of the Whole.

That the panel be asked for comments on, but not limited to:

1. The relationship between the scale of the proposed development and the OCP policy that supports new additions that conserve and enhance heritage property.
2. Does the proposal appropriately respond to Standard 1 of the National Standards and Guidelines in respect to the removal of heritage designated elements/additions and the relocation of the Cartreff and Temple buildings.
3. Does the proposal respond appropriately to Standard 11 of the National Standards and Guidelines in terms of new construction being physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to, yet distinguishable from, the historic place.
4. Does the Conservation Plan adequately address the National Standards and Guidelines and provide appropriate detail on how the proposal responds to the Guidelines.
5. Has adequate information been provided by the applicant to support the claim that the level of Burdett Street has been raised over time and that this justifies the moving and raising of the Cartreff house.

6. Does the proposed landscape plan respect and retain historic landscaping appropriate to the 1860s Mt. St. Angela building and the 1905, Samuel McClure designed, Cartreff House as outlined in the Standards and Guidelines.”

## **BACKGROUND**

### **Advisory Design Panel**

This Application was referred to the Advisory Design Panel (ADP) on July 27, 2016. The staff report and minutes from the meeting are attached for reference and the following motion was carried (unanimous):

“That the Advisory Design Panel recommend to Council that Rezoning Application # 00466 and Heritage Application # 00214 for 913-929 Burdett Avenue and 914-924 McClure Street be approved with recommendations as follows:

- to reconsider the 6-storey massing at the southwest corner
- to reconsider the 3-storey massing on the McClure elevation
- to reconsider the variety of window sizes and types
- resolution of structure, window glazing and materials of the window wall in the atrium to reflect the consideration that has gone into the rest of the project.”

The architect’s detailed response to the Panel’s recommendations (date stamped November 8, 2016) is attached to this report. The Applicant has responded to ADP’s recommendations as follows:

- the proposed density decreased from 1.98:1 to 1.96:1 floor space ratio (FSR)
- the massing on the south west corner has been reduced by increasing the setback from McClure Street at the fifth storey by 1m and reducing the overall number of units by eight (including four on the sixth storey). This density was relocated to the south portion of the east wing.
- the units along McClure Street have been revised to provide a unified expression for the first three storeys with modulations in the south elevation and the creation of bay windows
- additional windows have been included on the east elevation
- overall the number of window types has been reduced from 22 to 10
- additional detail for the glass atrium has been provided including structural glass fins
- the application of exterior finishes and materials has been refined.

The changes to the massing and proportion of the building in the south west corner are an improvement, and the refinement of the McClure Street frontage provides a sensitive response to the immediate context. The supporting perspective views demonstrate an articulation of the south elevation that respond well to the street with additional entrances to the ground floor units, and modulation in the façade that suggests a townhouse built form, despite the upper units being configured internally as apartments.

### **Heritage Advisory Panel**

The Heritage Advisory Panel met on July 12, 2016, to review the Application (staff report and minutes attached). The following motion was carried (unanimously).



"That the Panel recommend to Council that Heritage Alteration Permit Application No. 00214 for 913-929 Burdett Avenue and 914-924 McClure Street be declined."

In summary, the Heritage Advisory Panel felt the proposed development's use is inappropriate in terms of scale and its attention to the natural landscape, existing outbuildings, adjacent heritage properties and view corridors. The panel was also concerned due to the Angela College being among the most significant historical buildings in Victoria and the province of British Columbia. However, staff respectfully disagreed with this assessment as the Application does meet the *Official Community Plan (OCP)* policy in terms of supporting new additions that conserve and enhance heritage property, as well as the general standards of the *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada* - in particular, the relocation of an historic place within its current context maintains its heritage value, and the development is physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to, and distinguishable from the historic place.

### Project Details

**Applicant:** Mr. John Keay  
Keay Cecco Architecture Ltd.

**Architect:** Mr. John Keay  
Keay Cecco Architecture Ltd.

**Development Permit Area:** Development Permit Area 16, General Form and Character

**Heritage Status:** Designated

The following data table compares the proposal with the existing CD-10 Zone, Mount St. Angela District. An asterisk is used to identify where the proposal is less stringent than the existing zone.

Zoning Criteria	Proposal	Zone Standard CD-10 (combined development areas)
Site area (m <sup>2</sup> ) - minimum	5429.00	3978.00
Density (Floor Space Ratio) - maximum	1.98:1*	1.3:1
Height (m) - maximum	20.53*	13.60
Storeys - maximum	6*	4
Site coverage % - maximum	49.4*	37.91
Open site space % - minimum	38*	46.56

<b>Zoning Criteria</b>	<b>Proposal</b>	<b>Zone Standard CD-10 (combined development areas)</b>
Setbacks (m) - minimum		
Front (Burdett Avenue)	8.80*	10.60
Rear (McClure Street)	4.23* (building) 3.70* (stairs)	5.40
Side (east)	3.60*	3.60
Side (west)	1.70* (Cartreff) 3.20* (building)	3.60
Parking - minimum	46*	60
Visitor parking (minimum) included in the overall units	3*	4
Bicycle parking stalls (minimum)	108	108
Bicycle parking stalls (minimum)	6	6

## CONCLUSION

The Joint Heritage Advisory and Advisory Design Panel is requested to provide advice to Committee on the aspects identified earlier in this report.

Respectfully submitted,

Charlotte Wain  
Senior Planner  
Development Services Division

Merinda Conley  
Senior Heritage Planner  
Development Services Division

## ATTACHMENTS

- Aerial Map
- Zoning Map
- Staff report to Committee of the Whole for Heritage Alteration Permit Application No. 00214, dated December 16, 2016
- Staff report to Committee of the Whole for Rezoning Application No. 00466 dated December 16, 2016
- Letter from John Keay, Keay Cecco Architecture Ltd., date stamped December 15, 2016
- Letter from Larry Cecco, Keay Cecco Architecture Ltd., date stamped November 8, 2016
- Background Documentation, dated December 15, 2016
- Letter from Safe Design Council, received February 12, 2016
- Design Rationale, dated November 8, 2016
- Mount St. Angela Conservation Plan, Donald Luxton and Associates, dated September 2010 (enclosed)
- Letter from Donald Luxton, date stamped March 18, 2016
- Plans, dated November 8, 2016 (enclosed)
- Land lift analysis, dated October 27, 2016
- Staff report to Heritage Advisory Panel, dated July 5, 2016
- Minutes of July 12, 2016, Heritage Advisory Panel meeting
- Staff report to Advisory Design Panel, dated July 27, 2016
- Minutes of July 27, 2016, Design Advisory Panel meeting.